

Rating Update: Moody's Investors Service Upgrades Burlington, Vermont Electric Revenue Bonds to Baa1 from Baa2; Outlook Stable

Global Credit Research - 09 Nov 2015

#### **Upgrade Recognizes Financial Position Improvement**

BURLINGTON (CITY OF) VT ELECTRIC ENTERPRISE Electric Distribution VT

NEW YORK, November 09, 2015 --Moody's Investors Service has upgraded the rating on the outstanding \$29.03 million Burlington, Vermont Electric System Revenue Bonds to Baa1 from Baa2. The outlook is stable. Burlington also has \$46.8 million General Obligation bonds issued for electric utility purposes (Baa2; positive). The city issues approximately \$3 million General Obligation bonds annually for electric purposes. The pledge of payment is after the payment of debt service on the electric system revenue bonds.

#### SUMMARY RATING RATIONALE

The rating upgrade takes into consideration the improved financial record of Burlington Electric Department (BED); competitive rates; the shift to a more diverse power supply mix; and the strengthening local economy.

BED serves the City of Burlington, Vermont (Baa2 positive) which has a diverse local economy; stability is provided by the institutional presence of a major university and medical center; and the city serves as a commercial center for a large geographic area. The rating also considers BED's reliable and competitive power supply which is less subject to market volatility and is significantly renewable; the utility's improving financial record including expected strengthening forecasted metrics; and supportive rate regulation. While the BED is subject to the state public service board regulation, new rates may be collected 45 days after the filing with the state. The regulatory board must consider bond covenants and sufficiency of revenues to support voted bonded authorizations. The rate setting record has been supportive and timely with full recovery of requested costs recovered since 2004. The utility has a conservative General Fund transfer policy.

A positive factor in the rating is the proactive stance of management in its strategic planning regarding the evolving power industry. A focus on efficiency programs; renewable energy supply and positioning the utility organization through improved operations factor into our view about BED. Retail rates are also competitive. While the McNeil Generation Station, a wood burning electric generation facility represents 43.9% of FY 2015 BED energy, the carbon neutral-renewable energy source is well-maintained and has had a sound operating record. Vermont is also exempt from the federal EPA Clean Power Plan (CPP) so compliance issues are not a factor.

BED's financial record has been improving with a focus on stronger financial metrics with adjusted debt service coverage trending towards 1.50 times and forecasted coverage in the same range. The adjusted coverage includes payment of General Obligation bond debt service. Combined electric revenue bond and General Obligation bond debt service is level. FY 2015 financial results include adjusted debt service coverage of 1.71 times and days liquidity on hand of 94 days. BED's elimination of a material adverse clause from its line of credit also was a positive factor. BED expects an erosion of net income in FY 2018 due to several factors but management is taking reasonable mitigation measures to resolve. In addition, BED has had a sound record of rate adjustments when appropriate. No additional rate adjustments are currently expected in next two fiscal years.

### **OUTLOOK**

The stable outlook reflects the improving trend of BED's financial position that is reflected in the utility's financial forecasts showing continued improvement in financial metrics.

## **STRENGTHS**

\*More diverse and cleaner mix of power supply resources than previously utilized mitigating industry challenges such as market price disruptions and carbon regulation. Vermont is exempt from CPP.

- \*Sound financial management with forward-looking financial polices to maintain sound financial metrics
- \*Burlington has a diverse economy with colleges, a major hospital and the city is the economic center of region.
- \*Experienced management focused on industry transition including ensuring utility fixed cost recovery through rate structure changes
- \*Strong reliability indicators for distribution system

#### **CHALLENGES**

- \*Like most municipal electric utilities transition to more distributive generation including roof top solar represents new challenges
- \*McNeil wood fueled generation facility has dominant role but has had strong operating record and adequate fuel supply
- \*No base rate increase since 2009
- \*While regulated on rate-setting by the state board, the rate setting record reflects full cost recovery and the ability to increase rates within 45 days after filing with the state with later true-up.

#### WHAT COULD CHANGE THE RATING UP

- \*The rating could be upgraded once BED registered a longer trend of both debt service coverage and adjusted days liquidity
- \*Continued and sustained improvement in the City of Burlington general financial record

## WHAT COULD CHANGE THE RATING DOWN

- \*Deterioration in financial record of the city and utility
- \*Unsupportive regulatory board regarding cost recovery and the maintenance of sound utility financial metrics

#### RECENT DEVELOPMENTS

- \*The city's Burlington Telecom (BT) legal issues and enterprise risks are now in past and city is managing the enterprise well. BED was not impacted.
- \*Elimination of the material adverse clause in the utility's line of credit was a positive factor

## **DETAILED RATING RATIONALE**

## Revenue Generating Base

The utility serves the City of Burlington, Vermont, the state's largest city and economic center. BED has a monopoly in the service area. BED is regulated by the state public service board but it is not like an investor-owned utility oversight. The board has to take into consideration bond covenants and newly filed rates may be collected 45 days after filing with the state subject to later true-up. No historic record of lag or inadequate recovery. University of Vermont and regional medical center represent more than 20% of the customer base revenues. It is unlikely the university or medical center would relocate, lessening the concentration risk as a consideration.

BED rates are competitive in all customer classes with residential rates being substantially below state average.

Burlington, Vermont is the economic center for the state; has had an expanding local economy with several redevelopment and smart development projects; customer base is stable but demand has shrunk due to extensive energy efficiency program.

BED's power supply mix is substantially renewable energy through both owned and purchased energy resources. McNeil Plant, a wood-burning generation facility, represented 43.9% of power supply sources, operated well in FY 2015 with a 63.6% capacity factor.

#### **GOVERNANCE AND MANAGEMENT**

The utility is governed by the Mayor and 12-member city council. The mayor is elected every three years and each member of the city council have two year terms. The current mayor was recently re-elected. The mayor and city council appoint 5 representatives to serve 3 year terms on the advisory Board of the Electric Commissioners. Most operating decisions are made by the BED and there is a degree of separation from the city such as an independent auditor; limited General Fund transfers in the form of PILOTS; a line of credit independent from the city.

Ultimately rate filings must be approved by the Mayor and City Council. Following local approval, the Vermont Public Service Board (PSB) reviews the rates, the quality of services, and financial management of the utility.

#### Financial Operations and Position

BED has had an improving financial record with adjusted debt service coverage trending higher in the 1.5x range between 2013-2015. BED operating efficiencies, average weather, and renewable energy credit sales have been positive factors in the financial trend. Forecasts reflect adjusted debt service coverage improving in 2016-2018 but several factors may lead to a net income deficit in 2018. BED has identified several mitigation measures to correct. Those mitigation measures include pre-authorization of renewable energy credit sales; standard offer exemption and promoting solar development behind the meter. Assumptions include no rate adjustments; average weather conditions and impacts on sales from energy efficiency programs.

## Liquidity

BED days liquidity on hand has been improving with FY 2015 liquidity days on hand at 94. The three year average 2013-2015 was 66 days. BED has a \$5 million line-of-credit also available.

Debt Structure and Capital Improvement Plan

BED has a conservative debt structure with fixed rate debt, voted authorization to issue bonds which Vermont Public Service Board has to incorporate in rate-setting, and level debt service. The debt service on the General Obligation bonds issued by the City of Burlington is paid after the payment of debt service on the electric system revenue bonds.

BED expects to spend about \$10 million annually between 2016-2018 on capital improvements, which includes new transmission investments. BED projects a new electric revenue bond issuance in 2017 (\$7.5 million) and 2018 (\$6 million) and about \$3 million annually through city General Obligation financings.

**Debt-Related Derivatives** 

None

## Pension and OPEB

BED is covered by the City of Burlington pension and OPEB. The city participates in the Burlington Employee Retirement System, a single-employer, defined benefit retirement plan. The city's annual required contribution (ARC, net of BED and school department) for the plan was \$5.4 million in fiscal 2014, or 10.8% of General Fund expenditures. The city's 2013 adjusted net pension liability, under Moody's methodology for adjusting reported pension data, is \$162.7 million, or an above average 1.4 times General Fund revenues. Moody's uses the adjusted net pension liability to improve comparability of reported pension liabilities. The adjustments are not intended to replace the city's reported liability information, but to improve comparability with other rated entities.

The city contributed 86% of its annual Other Post Employment Benefit costs in 2014, representing \$381,268. The city's OPEB UAAL as of June 30, 2013 is \$3.9 million. Fiscal 2014 total fixed costs including pension, OPEB and debt service was \$9.3 million or 18.3% of expenditures.

Methodology Scorecard Factors: US Public Power Electric Utilities: Burlington Electric

As indicated below, the grid indicated rating for Burlington Electric is A3. The rating assigned to the outstanding electric revenue bonds is Baa1. The difference between the grid-indicated rating of A3 and the rating of Baa1 primarily reflects the financial metrics have not yet registered fully in the A category on a three-year basis and the City of Burlington remains at Baa2-positive due to a history of governance issues.

The grid is a reference tool that can be used to approximate credit profiles in the public power electric utility sector in most cases. However, the grid is a summary that does not include every rating consideration. Please see the

US Public Power Electric Utilities with Generation Ownership Exposure Methodology for more information about the limitations inherent to grids.

Current Rating: Baa1

1.Cost Recovery Framework (25% weight)- (A)

2. Willingness to Recover Costs and Maintain Sound Financial Metrics- (25% weight) (Baa)

3. Management of Generation Risk-(10% weight) (A)

4.Rate Competitiveness- (10% weight) (A) (-2.3%)

5. Financial Strength:

Sub factor a) Adjusted Days Liquidity on Hand-(10% weight) (66 days)

Sub factor b) Debt Ratio-(10% weight) (55.5%)

Sub factor c) Fixed Obligation Charge Coverage (10% weight) (1.52x)

Notching Factor: None

Grid Indicated rating: A3

**Key Facts** 

City of Burlington GO rating: Baa2 positive

Three-year average days liquidity, 2013-2015: 66 days

Median for top 30 City Utilities That Own Generation 2014 - 239 days

Three-year average adjusted debt service coverage, 2013-2015: 1.52 times

Median for top 30 City Utilities That Own Generation 2014 - 1.95

## **OBLIGOR PROFILE**

The utility serves the City of Burlington, Vermont, the state's largest city and economic center. BED is a department of the city government and has a monopoly in service area. BED is regulated by state public service board but is not like an investor-owned utility oversight.

## LEGAL SECURITY

The bonds are secured by the net revenues of the electric system. There is a 1.25 times rate covenant and the debt service reserve requirement is equal to maximum annual debt service on the senior revenue bonds.

The department also has approximately \$43 million of general obligation (GO) bonds that are expected to be repaid from electric department operating revenues. The rate covenant on the consolidated debt outstanding is 1.00 times. Per the General Bond Resolution, the claim on the revenues of the department by the revenue bondholders is prior to any claim of the GO bondholders.

**USE OF PROCEEDS** 

N/A

**Issuer Contact:** 

Neale F. Lunderville

General Manager

**Burlington Electric Department** 

nlunderville@burlingtonelectric.com

#### (802)865-7415

#### PRINCIPAL METHODOLOGY

The principal methodology used in this rating was U.S. Public Power Electric Utilities with Generation Ownership Exposure published in November 2011. Please see the Credit Policy page on www.moodys.com for a copy of this methodology.

## REGULATORY DISCLOSURES

For ratings issued on a program, series or category/class of debt, this announcement provides certain regulatory disclosures in relation to each rating of a subsequently issued bond or note of the same series or category/class of debt or pursuant to a program for which the ratings are derived exclusively from existing ratings in accordance with Moody's rating practices. For ratings issued on a support provider, this announcement provides certain regulatory disclosures in relation to the rating action on the support provider and in relation to each particular rating action for securities that derive their credit ratings from the support provider's credit rating. For provisional ratings, this announcement provides certain regulatory disclosures in relation to the provisional rating assigned, and in relation to a definitive rating that may be assigned subsequent to the final issuance of the debt, in each case where the transaction structure and terms have not changed prior to the assignment of the definitive rating in a manner that would have affected the rating. For further information please see the ratings tab on the issuer/entity page for the respective issuer on www.moodys.com.

Regulatory disclosures contained in this press release apply to the credit rating and, if applicable, the related rating outlook or rating review.

Please see www.moodys.com for any updates on changes to the lead rating analyst and to the Moody's legal entity that has issued the rating.

Please see the ratings tab on the issuer/entity page on www.moodys.com for additional regulatory disclosures for each credit rating.

# **Analysts**

Dan Aschenbach Lead Analyst Public Finance Group Moody's Investors Service

Thomas Brigandi Backup Analyst Public Finance Group Moody's Investors Service

Chee Mee Hu MANAGING\_DIRECTOR Public Finance Group Moody's Investors Service

Kurt Krummenacker Additional Contact Public Finance Group Moody's Investors Service

#### Contacts

Journalists: (212) 553-0376 Research Clients: (212) 553-1653

Moody's Investors Service, Inc. 250 Greenwich Street New York, NY 10007



© 2015 Moody's Corporation, Moody's Investors Service, Inc., Moody's Analytics, Inc. and/or their licensors and affiliates (collectively, "MOODY'S"). All rights reserved.

CREDIT RATINGS ISSUED BY MOODY'S INVESTORS SERVICE, INC. AND ITS RATINGS AFFILIATES ("MIS") ARE MOODY'S CURRENT OPINIONS OF THE RELATIVE FUTURE CREDIT RISK OF ENTITIES CREDIT COMMITMENTS. OR DEBT OR DEBT-LIKE SECURITIES. AND CREDIT RATINGS AND RESEARCH PUBLICATIONS PUBLISHED BY MOODY'S ("MOODY'S PUBLICATIONS") MAY INCLUDE MOODY'S CURRENT OPINIONS OF THE RELATIVE FUTURE CREDIT RISK OF ENTITIES, CREDIT COMMITMENTS, OR DEBT OR DEBT-LIKE SECURITIES. MOODY'S DEFINES CREDIT RISK AS THE RISK THAT AN ENTITY MAY NOT MEET ITS CONTRACTUAL, FINANCIAL OBLIGATIONS AS THEY COME DUE AND ANY ESTIMATED FINANCIAL LOSS IN THE EVENT OF DEFAULT. CREDIT RATINGS DO NOT ADDRESS ANY OTHER RISK, INCLUDING BUT NOT LIMITED TO: LIQUIDITY RISK, MARKET VALUE RISK, OR PRICE VOLATILITY. CREDIT RATINGS AND MOODY'S OPINIONS INCLUDED IN MOODY'S PUBLICATIONS ARE NOT STATEMENTS OF CURRENT OR HISTORICAL FACT. MOODY'S PUBLICATIONS MAY ALSO INCLUDE QUANTITATIVE MODEL-BASED ESTIMATES OF CREDIT RISK AND RELATED OPINIONS OR COMMENTARY PUBLISHED BY MOODY'S ANALYTICS, INC. CREDIT RATINGS AND MOODY'S PUBLICATIONS DO NOT CONSTITUTE OR PROVIDE INVESTMENT OR FINANCIAL ADVICE, AND CREDIT RATINGS AND MOODY'S PUBLICATIONS ARE NOT AND DO NOT PROVIDE RECOMMENDATIONS TO PURCHASE, SELL, OR HOLD PARTICULAR SECURITIES. NEITHER CREDIT RATINGS NOR MOODY'S PUBLICATIONS COMMENT ON THE SUITABILITY OF AN INVESTMENT FOR ANY PARTICULAR INVESTOR, MOODY'S ISSUES ITS CREDIT RATINGS AND PUBLISHES MOODY'S PUBLICATIONS WITH THE EXPECTATION AND UNDERSTANDING THAT EACH INVESTOR WILL, WITH DUE CARE, MAKE ITS OWN STUDY AND EVALUATION OF EACH SECURITY THAT IS UNDER CONSIDERATION FOR PURCHASE, HOLDING, OR SALE.

MOODY'S CREDIT RATINGS AND MOODY'S PUBLICATIONS ARE NOT INTENDED FOR USE BY RETAIL INVESTORS AND IT WOULD BE RECKLESS FOR RETAIL INVESTORS TO CONSIDER MOODY'S CREDIT RATINGS OR MOODY'S PUBLICATIONS IN MAKING ANY INVESTMENT DECISION. IF IN DOUBT YOU SHOULD CONTACT YOUR FINANCIAL OR OTHER PROFESSIONAL ADVISER.

ALL INFORMATION CONTAINED HEREIN IS PROTECTED BY LAW, INCLUDING BUT NOT LIMITED TO, COPYRIGHT LAW, AND NONE OF SUCH INFORMATION MAY BE COPIED OR OTHERWISE REPRODUCED, REPACKAGED, FURTHER TRANSMITTED, TRANSFERRED, DISSEMINATED, REDISTRIBUTED OR RESOLD, OR STORED FOR SUBSEQUENT USE FOR ANY SUCH PURPOSE, IN WHOLE OR IN PART, IN ANY FORM OR MANNER OR BY ANY MEANS WHATSOEVER, BY ANY PERSON WITHOUT MOODY'S PRIOR WRITTEN CONSENT.

All information contained herein is obtained by MOODY'S from sources believed by it to be accurate and reliable. Because of the possibility of human or mechanical error as well as other factors, however, all information contained herein is provided "AS IS" without warranty of any kind. MOODY'S adopts all necessary measures so that the information it uses in assigning a credit rating is of sufficient quality and from sources MOODY'S considers to be reliable including, when appropriate, independent third-party sources. However, MOODY'S is not an auditor and cannot in every instance independently verify or validate information received in the rating process or in preparing the Moody's Publications.

To the extent permitted by law, MOODY'S and its directors, officers, employees, agents, representatives, licensors and suppliers disclaim liability to any person or entity for any indirect, special, consequential, or incidental losses or damages whatsoever arising from or in connection with the information contained herein or the use of or inability to use any such information, even if MOODY'S or any of its directors, officers, employees, agents, representatives, licensors or suppliers is advised in advance of the possibility of such losses or damages, including but not limited to: (a) any loss of present or prospective profits or (b) any loss or damage arising where the relevant financial instrument is not the subject of a particular credit rating assigned by MOODY'S.

To the extent permitted by law, MOODY'S and its directors, officers, employees, agents, representatives, licensors and suppliers disclaim liability for any direct or compensatory losses or damages caused to any person or entity,

including but not limited to by any negligence (but excluding fraud, willful misconduct or any other type of liability that, for the avoidance of doubt, by law cannot be excluded) on the part of, or any contingency within or beyond the control of, MOODY'S or any of its directors, officers, employees, agents, representatives, licensors or suppliers, arising from or in connection with the information contained herein or the use of or inability to use any such information.

NO WARRANTY, EXPRESS OR IMPLIED, AS TO THE ACCURACY, TIMELINESS, COMPLETENESS, MERCHANTABILITY OR FITNESS FOR ANY PARTICULAR PURPOSE OF ANY SUCH RATING OR OTHER OPINION OR INFORMATION IS GIVEN OR MADE BY MOODY'S IN ANY FORM OR MANNER WHATSOEVER.

Moody's Investors Service, Inc., a wholly-owned credit rating agency subsidiary of Moody's Corporation ("MCO"), hereby discloses that most issuers of debt securities (including corporate and municipal bonds, debentures, notes and commercial paper) and preferred stock rated by Moody's Investors Service, Inc. have, prior to assignment of any rating, agreed to pay to Moody's Investors Service, Inc. for appraisal and rating services rendered by it fees ranging from \$1,500 to approximately \$2,500,000. MCO and MIS also maintain policies and procedures to address the independence of MIS's ratings and rating processes. Information regarding certain affiliations that may exist between directors of MCO and rated entities, and between entities who hold ratings from MIS and have also publicly reported to the SEC an ownership interest in MCO of more than 5%, is posted annually at www.moodys.com under the heading "Investor Relations — Corporate Governance — Director and Shareholder Affiliation Policy."

For Australia only: Any publication into Australia of this document is pursuant to the Australian Financial Services License of MOODY'S affiliate, Moody's Investors Service Pty Limited ABN 61 003 399 657AFSL 336969 and/or Moody's Analytics Australia Pty Ltd ABN 94 105 136 972 AFSL 383569 (as applicable). This document is intended to be provided only to "wholesale clients" within the meaning of section 761G of the Corporations Act 2001. By continuing to access this document from within Australia, you represent to MOODY'S that you are, or are accessing the document as a representative of, a "wholesale client" and that neither you nor the entity you represent will directly or indirectly disseminate this document or its contents to "retail clients" within the meaning of section 761G of the Corporations Act 2001. MOODY'S credit rating is an opinion as to the creditworthiness of a debt obligation of the issuer, not on the equity securities of the issuer or any form of security that is available to retail clients. It would be dangerous for "retail clients" to make any investment decision based on MOODY'S credit rating. If in doubt you should contact your financial or other professional adviser.

For Japan only: MOODY'S Japan K.K. ("MJKK") is a wholly-owned credit rating agency subsidiary of MOODY'S Group Japan G.K., which is wholly-owned by Moody's Overseas Holdings Inc., a wholly-owned subsidiary of MCO. Moody's SF Japan K.K. ("MSFJ") is a wholly-owned credit rating agency subsidiary of MJKK. MSFJ is not a Nationally Recognized Statistical Rating Organization ("NRSRO"). Therefore, credit ratings assigned by MSFJ are Non-NRSRO Credit Ratings. Non-NRSRO Credit Ratings are assigned by an entity that is not a NRSRO and, consequently, the rated obligation will not qualify for certain types of treatment under U.S. laws. MJKK and MSFJ are credit rating agencies registered with the Japan Financial Services Agency and their registration numbers are FSA Commissioner (Ratings) No. 2 and 3 respectively.

MJKK or MSFJ (as applicable) hereby disclose that most issuers of debt securities (including corporate and municipal bonds, debentures, notes and commercial paper) and preferred stock rated by MJKK or MSFJ (as applicable) have, prior to assignment of any rating, agreed to pay to MJKK or MSFJ (as applicable) for appraisal and rating services rendered by it fees ranging from JPY200,000 to approximately JPY350,000,000. MJKK and MSFJ also maintain policies and procedures to address Japanese regulatory requirements.