

Department of Planning and Zoning

149 Church Street, City Hall
Burlington, VT 05401
www.burlingtonvt.gov/pz
Phone: (802) 865-7188
Fax: (802) 865-7195

David White, AICP, Director
Ken Lerner, Assistant Director
Vacant, Comprehensive Planner
Jay Appleton, Senior GIS/IT Programmer/Analyst
Scott Gustin, AICP, CFM, Interim Chief Administrative Officer
Mary O'Neil, AICP, Senior Planner
Elsie Tillotson, Department Secretary
Anita Wade, Zoning Clerk



MEMORANDUM

To: The Design Advisory Board
From: Mary O'Neil, AICP, Senior Planner
RE: 122 Summit Street ZP16-0128CA
Date: August 25, 2015

File: ZP16-0128CA
Location: 122 Summit Street
Zone: RL **Ward:** 6S
Date application accepted: July 24, 2015
Applicant/ Owner: Ramsay Gourd Architects / Robert and Sally Linder
Request: New front porch, bay window on west elevation third floor, mudroom addition on east, conversion of attic to living space with new dormers and egress deck on each (rear) side.



Background:

- **Non-Applicability of Zoning Permit Requirements 16-0127NA;** replacement of painted wood shingle siding with same. Repair/replace trim as required. July 2015.
- **Zoning Permit 89-465;** Convert existing 2nd story of existing detached garage to living/studio space. Install 18' x 36' inground pool. Garage work to include construction of 10' gabled dormer, 8' x 10' second story balcony, first floor door to access interior stairs. Bathroom facilities to be provided. Approved September 1989 conditioned that the expansion of living space into the garage in no way allows for the establishment of a second residential unit. Property remains a single family residence.
- **Zoning Permit** request; Conditional Use request to change single family home to a single family home with home occupation, doctor's office. Erect a 72 sf. addition to the rear of the existing porch. **Denied**, March 1977.

Overview:

Part 1: Land Division Design Standards

Not applicable.

Part 2: Site Plan Design Standards

Sec. 6.2.2 Review Standards

(a) Protection of Important Natural Features:

Not applicable.

The programs and services of the City of Burlington are accessible to people with disabilities. For accessibility information call 865-7188 (for TTY users 865-7142).

(b) Topographical Alterations:

None proposed. Not applicable.

(c) Protection of Important Public Views:

There are no protected public views from the site. Not applicable.

(d) Protection of Important Cultural Resources:

Burlington's architectural and cultural heritage shall be protected through sensitive and respectful redevelopment, rehabilitation, and infill. Archeological sites likely to yield information important to the city's or the region's pre-history or history shall be evaluated, documented, and avoided whenever feasible. Where the proposed development involves sites listed or eligible for listing on a state or national register of historic places, the applicant shall meet the applicable development and design standards pursuant to Sec. 5.4.8(b).

See Section 5.4.8, below.

(e) Supporting the Use of Renewable Energy Resources:

No part of this application will prevent the use of wind, solar, water, geothermal or other alternative or renewable energy resources.

(f) Brownfield Sites:

None identified. Not applicable.

(g) Provide for nature's events:

Special attention shall be accorded to stormwater runoff so that neighboring properties and/or the public stormwater drainage system are not adversely affected. All development and site disturbance shall follow applicable city and state erosion and stormwater management guidelines in accordance with the requirements of Art 5, Sec 5.5.3.

Design features which address the effects of rain, snow, and ice at building entrances, and to provisions for snow and ice removal or storage from circulation areas shall also be incorporated.

The development itself is not disturbing more than 400 sf, so an Erosion Prevention and Sediment Control Plan is not required.

An underlying desire of this project is to address a persistent water issue at the front (west) elevation, where runoff channels between a roof eave and the entrance portico, finding its way into the basement. The applicant's design team has offered a design solution with a metal roofed canopy. See Article 5, Section 5.4.8 for continued discussion.

The east (rear) elevation has a proposed mudroom extension, with a deep eave to protect residents from inclement weather as they enter/exit.

(h) Building Location and Orientation:

No change. Not applicable.

(i) Vehicular Access:

No change. Not applicable.

(j) Pedestrian Access:

No change. Not applicable.

(k) Accessibility for the Handicapped:

This is not required for single family residences, but visibility standards may apply. The building inspector will have jurisdiction for compliance with applicable ADA standards.

(l) Parking and Circulation:

No change. Not applicable.

(m) Landscaping and Fences:

No changes are included within the plan.

(n) Public Plazas and Open Space:

Not applicable.

(o) Outdoor Lighting:

Where exterior lighting is proposed the applicant shall meet the lighting performance standards as per Sec 5.5.2.

No new exterior lighting is included within the submission materials; if any is proposed, spec sheets for proposed fixtures with illumination levels will need to be submitted.

(p) Integrate infrastructure into the design:

Exterior storage areas, machinery and equipment installations, service and loading areas, utility meters and structures, mailboxes, and similar accessory structures shall utilize setbacks, plantings, enclosures and other mitigation or screening methods to minimize their auditory and visual impact on the public street and neighboring properties to the extent practicable.

Utility and service enclosures and screening shall be coordinated with the design of the principal building, and should be grouped in a service court away from public view. On-site utilities shall be placed underground whenever practicable. Trash and recycling bins and dumpsters shall be located, within preferably, or behind buildings, enclosed on all four (4) sides to prevent blowing trash, and screened from public view.

Any development involving the installation of machinery or equipment which emits heat, vapor, fumes, vibration, or noise shall minimize, insofar as practicable, any adverse impact on neighboring properties and the environment pursuant to the requirements of Article 5, Part 4 Performance Standards.

No machinery or equipment installation is included within the plan. Mailbox will remain in existing location.

Part 3: Architectural Design Standards
Sec. 6.3.2 Review Standards

(a) Relate development to its environment:

1. Massing, Height and Scale:

The majority of the work is in the rear (east) elevation, and not visible from the street. The overall massing and scale of the structure will not visible be altered as viewed from the street.

2. Roofs and Rooflines.

The predominant and characteristic style represented here is Tudor Revival, with steeply pitched roofs and small lite windows. The inclusion of minor Colonial Revival details, like the door hood over the principle entrance and 6/6 windows illustrate the influence of that style in the 1920s; this house an interesting blend of distinctive stylistic characteristics of both. The streetscape provides a larger context to examine both styles. See Section 5.4.8, below for further discussion.

The application proposes replacement of the front door hood with a metal clad shed-roofed canopy, which is not typically associated with either style. See Section 5.4.8.

3. Building Openings

A small third story attic window is proposed to be replaced with a three-part bay window. See Section 5.4.8, below for further discussion.

(b) Protection of Important Architectural Resources:

Burlington's architectural and cultural heritage shall be protected through sensitive and respectful redevelopment, rehabilitation, and infill. Where the proposed development involves buildings listed or eligible for listing on a state or national register of historic places, the applicant shall meet the applicable development and design standards pursuant to Sec. 5.4.8. The introduction of new buildings to a historic district listed on a state or national register of historic places shall make every effort to be compatible with nearby historic buildings.

See Section 5.4.8.

(c) Protection of Important Public Views:

This is a private parcel; there are no protected views. Not applicable.

(d) Provide an active and inviting street edge:

The majority of the proposed alterations will occur on a façade not visible from the public right-of-way. The proposed replacement of the front porch roof and the third story window are intended to reflect the desire to address a water issue, and the expansion of living space into the attic. The property will continue to be inviting from the street edge.

(e) Quality of materials:

All development shall maximize the use of highly durable building materials that extend the life cycle of the building, and reduce maintenance, waste, and environmental impacts. Such materials are particularly important in certain highly trafficked locations such as along major streets, sidewalks, loading areas, and driveways. Efforts to incorporate the use of recycled content materials and building materials and products that are extracted and/or manufactured within the region are highly encouraged.

Owners of historic structures are encouraged to consult with an architectural historian in order to determine the most appropriate repair, restoration or replacement of historic building materials as outlined by the requirements of Art 5, Sec. 5.4.8.

The proposed new gable dormer on the rear will be slate roofed to match the existing; windows are aluminum clad, siding and trim to match existing. The proposed bay and entrance canopy will be metal standing seam. All are considered durable.

(f) Reduce energy utilization:

All development will be required to meet the *Guidelines for Energy Efficient Construction* pursuant to the requirement of Article VI. Energy Conservation, Section 8 of the City of Burlington Code of Ordinances.

(g) Make advertising features complementary to the site:

No signage is included with the application.

(h) Integrate infrastructure into the building design:

See Section 6.2.2. (p) above.

(i) Make spaces secure and safe:

Construction shall meet all applicable building and life safety code as defined by the Building Inspector and Fire Marshal, as appropriate.

Sec. 5.4.8 Historic Buildings and Sites

The City seeks to preserve, maintain, and enhance those aspects of the city having historical, architectural, archaeological, and cultural merit. Specifically, these regulations seek to achieve the following goals:

To preserve, maintain and enhance Burlington's historic character, scale, architectural integrity, and cultural resources;

To foster the preservation of Burlington's historic and cultural resources as part of an attractive, vibrant, and livable community in which to live, work and visit;

To promote a sense of community based on understanding the city's historic growth and development, and maintaining the city's sense of place by protecting its historic and cultural resources; and,

To promote the adaptive re-use of historic buildings and sites.

(a) *Applicability:*

These regulations shall apply to all buildings and sites in the city that are listed, or eligible for listing, on the State or National Register of Historic Places.

As such, a building or site may be found to be eligible for listing on the state or national register of historic places and subject to the provisions of this section if all of the following conditions are present:

1. *The building is 50 years old or older;*

122 Summit Street was constructed in 1928; therefore greater than 50 years old.

2. *The building or site is deemed to possess significance in illustrating or interpreting the heritage of the City, state or nation in history, architecture, archeology, technology and culture because one or more of the following conditions is present:*

- A. *Association with events that have made a significant contribution to the broad patterns of history;*

122 Summit Street reflects the residential expansion of the Hill Section of Burlington; specifically as providing high style dwellings of exceptional quality, many professional designed and reflecting popular architecture of the period.

or,

- B. *Association with the lives of persons significant in the past; or,*

- C. *Embodiment of distinctive characteristics of a type, period, or method of construction, or representation of the work of a master, or possession of high artistic values, or representation of a significant or distinguishable entity whose components may lack individual distinction;*

The residential structures on Summit Street reflect the increased prosperity of Burlington, with dwellings on large lots that were designed and constructed for more affluent professionals just after the First World War. Clearly evident are Tudor Revival, Colonial revival and similar early 20th century architectural styles. 122 Summit St. specifically presents a blended style; predominantly reflecting the Tudor presence



GORDON-VAN TINE HOMES

The Entrance

FROM HOME 574

THE charm of the Colonial Home depends largely on the handling of the entrance, for the plain, often severe, lines of true Colonial architecture need the relief of graceful entrance detail. Entrances to other Gordon-Van Tine Colonial Homes are similar to this one, while homes of other architectural types in this book have just as hospitable and carefully worked out entrances as the one shown above. Invariably the attractive appearance is gained by good design, and without the aid of costly material. The front door illustrated is furnished for all Colonial homes. Other types of architecture have beautiful glazed doors of harmonious design. Wherever blinds are shown they are furnished as shown above; solid for the lower windows; slatted for the second story. Sidelights and window boxes as illustrated are furnished whenever they are shown on any plan. This, and the following illustrations, emphasize the beauty and the completeness of all Gordon-Van Tine Homes. The smallest and most inexpensive house in this book is designed carefully as well as economically.

From Gordon-Van Tine "House Designs of the Twenties".

(steeply pitched roof, varied eave lines, window arrangement) with the period popular Colonial influence (6/6 windows, entry hood and slender tapered columns.) Several other examples of the Tudor style co-exist on this street (141, 176, and 178 Summit another blended style) as well as on neighboring streets (436 and 452 South Willard.) In the context of the street, style, and as representative of an identified period of domestic architecture, this house is eligible for historic designation.

The Vermont State Register listings for Summit Street end at house number 109, reflecting time and resource limitations in the effort to complete Historic Site and Structure Surveys in 1979.

or,

- D. Maintenance of an exceptionally high degree of integrity, original site orientation and virtually all character defining elements intact;*

122 Summit Street is virtually unaltered from its original appearance, and retains a high degree of integrity of design, materials, association, feeling, location, setting and workmanship.

or,

- E. Yielding, or may be likely to yield, information important to prehistory; and,*
- 3. The building or site possess a high degree of integrity of location, design, setting, materials, workmanship, feeling, and association*

See above.

(b) Standards and Guidelines:

The following development standards, following the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties, shall be used in the review of all applications involving historic buildings and sites subject to the provisions of this section and the requirements for Design Review in Art 3, Part 4. The Secretary of the Interior's Standards are basic principles created to help preserve the distinctive character of a historic building and its site. They are a series of concepts about maintaining, repairing and replacing historic features, as well as designing new additions or making alterations. These Standards are intended to be applied in a reasonable manner, taking into consideration economic and technical feasibility.

- 1. A property will be used as it was historically or be given a new use that requires minimal change to its distinctive materials, features, spaces, and spatial relationships.*

The property was designed as a single family residence; the use is not proposed to change.

- 2. The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features, spaces, and spatial relationships that characterize a property will be avoided.*

At question is the proposed alteration of the entrance portico and third story attic window.

Although pure Tudor examples may have no porch or only a small arched portico, 122 Summit reflects the influence of Colonial styling (the other most common architectural style in the early 1920s.) At present, the building is a visual confirmation of the popularity of both

styles. The removal of the Colonial door hood and replacement with a more modern shed roof is incongruous in this location.

The third floor window is among one of the truest character defining features of the Tudor style. As the influence was early 16th century English architecture, the small opening references an “arrow loop” or “loophole” for light, air, or shooting weaponry in defense. While first or second floor windows may reflect multi-paned or oriel (projecting) window arrangements, the third floor is most typically the smaller example.

The following are visual examples, as taken from McAllisters *Field Guide to American Houses*:



Cleveland OH, 1920s.



Toledo OH, 1920s.

Although stylistically windows mulled together, or infrequently bay windows may be evident on the first and second floors, large windows are mostly absent from third floors in the Tudor style. The proposal to introduce a three bay projecting window at the third floor on the primary façade at 122 Summit Street is an alteration that changes the spatial characteristics of the identified style, altering the original arrangement that is characteristic of the style and this example.

3. *Each property will be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or elements from other historic properties, will not be undertaken.*

The large third floor bay window is not original to the house, nor was originally proposed in the architectural plans. To add one now is inconsistent with the style and this particular example.

4. *Changes to a property that have acquired historic significance in their own right will be retained and preserved.*

None identified.

5. *Distinctive materials, features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property will be preserved.*

See above.

6. *Deteriorated historic features will be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature will match the old in design, color, texture, and, where possible, materials recognizing that new technologies may provide an appropriate alternative in order to adapt to ever changing conditions and provide for an efficient contemporary use. Replacement of missing features will be substantiated by documentary and physical evidence.*

Replacement of the front porch hood is not suggested due to material failure, but to address concerns about the water run-off pattern from the existing portico. The replacement does not match the existing; its replacement proposed to address a water runoff issue. There is no evidence that the front porch or third story window, as proposed, previously existed.

7. *Chemical or physical treatments, if appropriate, will be undertaken using the gentlest means possible. Treatments that cause damage to historic materials will not be used.*

No chemical or physical treatments are proposed.

8. *Archeological resources will be protected and preserved in place. If such resources must be disturbed, mitigation measures will be undertaken.*

None identified.

9. *New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale, and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.*

The Colonial entrance portico and the small third story window are both typical and representative characteristics of the blended Tudor/Colonial style at 122 Summit Street, and are recommended for retention.

Alterations to the rear and sides elevation will be largely unnoticed from the public right-of-way; will not exceed the existing building height, and are therefore acceptable.

10. New additions and adjacent or related new construction will be undertaken in such a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

Although unlikely it may be possible to consider the proposed alterations reversible if sound plans are provided for the existing features.

Items for the Board's consideration:

1. If lighting is proposed, spec sheets, fixture location, and illumination levels shall be submitted for staff review of conformance with Section 5.5.2.
2. The Design Advisory Board is consulted with particular direction in determining conformance to Article 6 and Section 5.4.8. Administrative authority is warranted in this review; staff will observe the recommendation of the DAB in permit issuance.