

## Department of Planning and Zoning

149 Church Street  
Burlington, VT 05401  
Telephone: (802) 865-7188  
(802) 865-7195 (FAX)  
(802) 865-7142 (TTY)

*David White, AICP, Director*  
*Meagan Tuttle, AICP, Comprehensive Planner*  
*Jay Appleton, GIS Manager*  
*Scott Gustin, AICP, CFM, Principal Planner*  
*Mary O'Neil, AICP, Principal Planner*  
*Ryan Morrison, CFM, Associate Planner*  
*Anita Wade, Zoning Clerk*  
*Elsie Tillotson, Department Secretary*



**TO:** Design Advisory Board  
**FROM:** Ryan Morrison  
**DATE:** October 25, 2016  
**RE:** 17-0455CA, 57 South Williams Street

---

Zone: RH                                      Ward: 1E  
Owner/Representative: Vermont Organization for Jewish Education – Chabad of Vermont  
Stewart Construction

**Request:** A two-level addition of approximately 5,500 sf to the west side of the existing building, to provide a new worship sanctuary on the upper level, with supporting spaces on the lower level, with new off-street parking, landscaping, and erosion prevention.

### **OVERVIEW:**

The applicant is requesting approval of a two-level addition to the existing Chabad Jewish Community Center, with associated off-street parking, and landscaping. The supporting facilities on the lower level will include a library room, a small chapel, and offices. Washrooms will be included on both levels and be handicap accessible. The addition will not be internally connected to the existing facility.

The projected occupancy of the new addition is to be 100 occupants, with moveable seating and tables. 25 additional parking spaces will be added to the existing parking lot.

The building, constructed in 1884, is listed in both the State and National Register of Historic Places. It is listed as a contributing resource in the Main Street – College Street Historic District (National Register). Section 5.4.8 therefore applies.

## **ARTICLE 6: DEVELOPMENT REVIEW STANDARDS**

### ***Part 1, Land Division Design Standards***

Not applicable.

### ***Part 2, Site Plan Design Standards***

#### ***Sec. 6.2.2, Review Standards***

##### ***(a) Protection of important natural features***

Not applicable.

##### ***(b) Topographical alterations***

The site has a steady east-to-west downslope, with an elevation ranging from 308' to 280' above sea level. The project will see an excavated area for the new building addition's footprint. Expansion of the existing parking area, to accommodate a total of 36 onsite parking spaces, is also proposed. Overall, the entire parking area will be paved with asphalt. Additional grading will occur immediately to the west of the expanded parking area to create a smoother downslope to a future stormwater detention basin/pond.

*(c) Protection of important public views*

There are no designated view sheds from or through the property.

*(d) Protection of important cultural resources*

The existing building is listed on both the National and State Registers of Historic places, and is a contributing resource in the Main Street – College Street Historic District. Under Sec. 5.4.8, new additions to historic buildings are to be constructed in a manner that will preserve historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work will differentiate from the historic building, and be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale, proportion, and massing. See Sec. 5.4.8 below.

*(e) Supporting the use of alternative energy*

The applicant proposes to place photovoltaic panels on the addition's south-facing rooftop.

*(f) Brownfield sites*

The property is not an identified brownfield.

*(g) Provide for nature's events*

Overall, the project will see a total lot coverage of 22,600 sf, a 6,600 sf increase to the existing 16,000 sf of lot coverage (from 26.8% to 37.9%). Currently, stormwater runoff at the eastern portion of the lot drains to the property lines, all other runoff drains to the backyard where there is room for infiltration. With the proposed building addition and expanded parking area, impervious area will increase. The applicant proposes to construct a stormwater detention basin on the western edge of the property to reduce runoff.

On the addition's south side, facing the parking area, the main entrance vestibule will provide a sheltered entrance. Two secondary entrances, one each on the north and south sides of the upper level are also proposed. The only shelter for the lower, ground level entrance is the roof overhang, approximately 23 ft above. Ample room remains onsite for seasonal snow storage.

*(h) Building location and orientation*

The new addition will locate on the rear of the existing building. It will be difficult to see from South Williams Street. The main entrance to the addition will face the parking area to the south. Also on the south wall of the addition is an ADA accessible entrance door that provides direct access to the elevator.

*(i) Vehicular access*

As with existing conditions, vehicular access will be provided from South Williams Street. The site currently has a driveway that horseshoes around the existing building, with two curb cuts onto South Williams Street. The proposal will see the removal of the northernmost driveway, which is currently only used for exit purposes. The southernmost driveway entrance will continue to serve the property. Parking spaces line the south side of the driveway. Additional parking spaces will locate on the opposite side of the driveway, adjacent to the existing building and proposed addition. A distance of 20 ft separates these parking rows. Turnaround space will be provided at the rear of the driveway/parking area.

*(j) Pedestrian access*

Pedestrian access to the existing, primary building is provided via a walkway from the public sidewalk to the front entrance. The existing building has additional accesses on the south side that are accessed by pedestrians from the driveway and/or parking area. The current proposal will see a new walkway between the driveway/parking area and the existing/new building. The new walkway will be elevated above the driving surface.

*(k) Accessibility for the handicapped*

The proposed parking area depicts handicap parking spaces and all building entries appear to be accessible at grade. The proposal also includes direct access to the internal elevator. A curb cut providing ADA access between the parking area and the elevated walkway is not identified on the plan and needs to be.

*(l) Parking and circulation*

Existing and proposed parking will be situated along the south-side property line, where existing vegetation provides a buffer from the adjacent property. New landscaping along the south property line will be installed to provide a buffer for the expanded parking. Another row of 10 parking spaces will be located on the opposite side of the driveway, facing the existing building and proposed addition. The row of 10 spaces will include 2 ADA accessible parking spaces, with a loading/unloading area between.

The building mass screens some of the parking in the rear from the street. However, the row of existing parking along the south property line extends to the front property line.

Dimensionally, the parking spaces are slightly smaller than the standard. The parking spaces along the south property line are just 19' deep, whereas 20' is the standard. And similarly, the widths of all parking spaces are 8.5', whereas 9' is the standard. The depth of the 10 parking spaces in front of the existing building and proposed addition are at least 20' deep. The minimum 20' back-up space is provided between the two parking rows in the rear of the parking area. However, the back-up space provided for the existing parking spaces along the south property line ranges from approx. 12' to 17'. The proposal includes a vehicular turnaround at the rear of the parking area.

The proposal includes 25 new exposed surface parking spaces. Surface parking areas of 15 or more spaces require at least 1 shade tree for every 5 parking spaces. The landscape plan shows 3 shade trees along the south property line, 3 shade trees at the rear of the parking area, and 2 shade trees between the new parking spaces closest to the building addition and the proposed playground location. The shade trees must be 2.5" – 3" caliper at planting with an expected mature canopy of at least 25' diameter. At least 30% of the surface parking should be shaded. No shading analysis has been provided and must be.

The project plans do not include indoor or outdoor bike parking spaces. Additional details relative to type and number of bike parking spaces are needed.

*(m) Landscaping and fences*

Some vegetation will be removed as a result of this proposal. However, the applicant has submitted a landscape plan intended to create a continuous green space that stretches across the west side of the property and wraps to the north and south to connect neighboring green spaces.

New plantings will help to screen surface parking from the neighboring property. It will also be used to create a 'park like feel' to the property. No new street trees are proposed.

*(n) Public plazas and open space*

No public plazas or open space are included in this proposal.

*(o) Outdoor lighting*

Outdoor illumination is proposed. Fixture cutsheets and a photometric plan have been provided. All of the fixtures are cutoff and acceptable. The photometric plan demonstrates acceptable parking and circulation illumination levels. Building entries are limited to a 5.0 footcandle average. Entry lighting levels must be included in the photometric plan.

*(p) Integrate infrastructure into the design*

All new utility lines must be buried. A heat-pump system is proposed that will have an outdoor mechanical unit. The location of this unit, as well as any other mechanical units, must be identified on the site plan. Mitigating and screening measures must be taken to minimize auditory and visual impacts from the public street and adjacent properties. A screened trash and recycling enclosure(s) will have to be included on the site plan as well. The dumpster must be set on a concrete pad.

**Part 3, Architectural Design Standards**

**Sec. 6.3.2, Review Standards**

*(a) Relate development to its environment*

*1. Massing, Height, and Scale*

The proposed addition is approximately a 1/3 of the size of the existing building. Additionally, because it will be attached to the rear of the existing 2 ½ story, 96' deep structure, it will be difficult to view from the public street. The proposed scale of the overall structure, including the proposed addition, will be within the context of other existing buildings in the area, particularly the multifamily buildings located on either side of the subject property. At a height of 28' 3 ½" above the south side grade, the 2-story addition will be approximately ½ the height of the existing structure. The overall building, including the proposed addition, is quite small in size when compared to the nearby apartment complexes.

*2. Roofs and Rooflines*

The addition will have a gable roof, topped with standing seam metal roofing. The proposed gable roof differs from the double peaked, hip roof of the existing structure. Photovoltaic panels are also proposed to locate on the southern roof face.

*3. Building Openings*

The proposed addition exhibits two fenestration patterns. The upper level fenestration includes tall casement/awning window styles in a manner consistent with that of a community gathering space or place of worship. The lower level fenestration includes a mix of awning and double-hung windows in a manner consistent with that of a daylight basement mixed-use space. Fenestration throughout is appropriately scaled and suited to its intended purpose. The addition's front entry is a projecting, non-insulated vestibule, walled with ¼ inch glazing, and aluminum clad doors. A split staircase inside the vestibule will provide access to both levels.

*(b) Protection of important architectural resources*

See 6.2.2 (d) above. The existing building is listed on both the National and State Registers of Historic places, and is a contributing resource in the Main Street – College Street Historic District. No alterations will occur to the existing historic structure by way of this permit. Under Sec. 5.4.8, new additions to historic buildings are to be constructed in a manner to preserve historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work will differentiate from the historic building, and be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale, proportion, and massing. See Sec. 5.4.8 below.

*(c) Protection of important public views*

See 6.2.2 (c) above.

*(d) Provide an active and inviting street edge*

The addition is locating at the rear of the existing building. No changes to the street edge are proposed.

*(e) Quality of materials*

Exterior cladding will consist of common bond brick rainscreen on the south and west facades of the upper level, and color metal rainscreen siding on the north façade. Cladding on the lower level will consist of a lightweight concrete finish. The roof will be a standing seam metal roof. The application does not specify the type of exterior cladding that will be used above the secondary entrances on the upper level. It appears that it will be color metal rainscreen. The applicant proposes aluminum clad wood awning windows on the upper floor, and a mix of aluminum clad wood awning and double-hung windows on the lower floor. The proposed materials are acceptable.

*(f) Reduce energy utilization*

As noted previously, the applicants are seeking to utilize energy efficient technologies for heating and cooling. A heat pump is included in the proposal. Additionally, the applicant proposes to install photovoltaic panels on the south-facing rooftop. Current city and state energy efficiency standards must be adhered to.

*(g) Make advertising features complimentary to the site*

The elevation drawing depicts a sign over the main entrance vestibule. It is noted on the plans that this sign will require a separate zoning permit. The sign appears to comply with signage regulations of Article 7.

*(h) Integrate infrastructure into the building design*

The project plans do not depict mechanical unit locations. The submittal includes spec sheets for a heat pump. Heat pump mechanical units are typically located outside. The applicant must locate the unit in a location and manner that both mitigates and screens its auditory and visual impact from neighboring properties and the public street. All new utility lines will have to be buried.

*(i) Make spaces safe and secure*

All building entries will be illuminated. Adherence to applicable building codes will be required.

**Sec. 5.4.8 Historic Buildings and Sites**

**(b) Standards and Guidelines:**

*The following development standards, following the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties, shall be used in the review of all applications involving historic buildings and sites subject to the provisions of this section and the requirements for Design Review in Art 3, Part 4. The Secretary of the Interior's Standards are basic principles created to help preserve the distinctive character of a historic building and its site. They are a series of concepts about maintaining, repairing and replacing historic features, as well as designing new additions or making alterations. These Standards are intended to be applied in a reasonable manner, taking into consideration economic and technical feasibility.*

1. *A property will be used as it was historically or be given a new use that requires minimal change to its distinctive materials, features, spaces, and spatial relationships.*

The use of the existing building will remain a Jewish Community Center. Uses within the new addition will be associate to the community center.

2. *The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features, spaces, and spatial relationships that characterize a property will be avoided.*

No alterations to the existing structure are proposed. With the proposed addition, the character of the property will remain consistent with the overall use. The addition will house uses associated with the existing Jewish Community Center. The proposed addition, which will be attached to the rear of the existing historic building, has been designed to be sensitive to the existing building's character without overwhelming the scale and massing of the overall structure.

3. *Each property will be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or elements from other historic properties, will not be undertaken.*

No conjectural features are proposed.

4. *Changes to a property that have acquired historic significance in their own right will be retained and preserved.*

The only alteration to the existing historic structure will be the attachment of the proposed addition to the rear. The rest of the structure will remain unchanged.

5. *Distinctive materials, features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property will be preserved.*

The existing historic structure will not be altered as a result of this proposal; with the exception of the attachment of the new addition to the existing building's rear.

6. *Deteriorated historic features will be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature will match the old in design, color, texture, and, where possible, materials recognizing that new technologies may provide an appropriate alternative in order to adapt to ever changing conditions and provide for an efficient contemporary use. Replacement of missing features will be substantiated by documentary and physical evidence.*

There are no plans for any repair or replacement work to take place on the existing structure.

7. *Chemical or physical treatments, if appropriate, will be undertaken using the gentlest means possible. Treatments that cause damage to historic materials will not be used.*

None proposed.

8. *Archeological resources will be protected and preserved in place. If such resources must be disturbed, mitigation measures will be undertaken.*

None identified.

9. *New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale, and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.*

The new addition is compatible, and inferior to, the size, scale and character of the existing historic structure. Materials differ from those on the existing structure. The 2.5 story, 5x 2 bay, brick veneer historic structure dominates the street edge. In fact, with the addition being located at the rear of the existing structure, it will be difficult to view from the public street. The addition will have a gable roof, running in a line consistent with the directional length of the existing structure. The historic structure consists various features, including a double peaked, hip roofed main block, five chimneys with corbelled caps, a main entry sheltered beneath a projecting entry porch fronted by an oversized, gable parapet with feet and an arched, stone faced portal. Windows are both paired and single, all 1/1 sliding sash with segmentally arched top sash, projecting marble sills, and segmental arched, rockfaced stone arches. A one story, shed roofed porch on the south side also exists.

The new addition will consist of a common bond brick rainscreen siding on the south and west facing, 2<sup>nd</sup> level facades. The 2<sup>nd</sup> level north façade will have color metal rainscreen siding. The roofing material for the new gable roof will be metal standing seam. As designed, the historic integrity of the property will remain undamaged.

10. *New additions and adjacent or related new construction will be undertaken in such a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.*

It would be possible to remove the proposed new addition, however unlikely.

**RECOMMENDED MOTION:**

Recommend approval and forward to the Development Review Board with the following conditions:

1. The site plan shall be revised to include:
  - a. All required parking spaces;
  - b. All required bicycle parking spaces;
  - c. The location of the garbage/recycling area. Any dumpsters must be placed on a concrete pad;
  - d. A curb cut on the walkway along the south side of the addition to accommodate ADA accessibility; and
  - e. The location of the heat pump mechanical unit, and associated mitigation/screening.
2. The curb cut for the exit drive to the north of the building shall be removed.

3. A shading analysis for the surface parking shall be submitted.
4. Entry lighting levels shall be included with the photometric plan.