MEMORANDUM

To: Design Advisory Board
From: Scott Gustin
Re: 352 South Winooski Avenue
Date: March 15, 2022

File: ZP-22-106
Location: 352 South Winooski Avenue
Zone: RM Ward: 6S
Parking District: Neighborhood
Date application accepted: February 22, 2022, Complete March 7, 2022
Applicant/Owner: Lewis Creek Builders / Joel & Wendy Hakken
Request: Home renovations and window replacement

Overview:
The applicant is seeking approval to install replacement windows throughout the historic single family home. Some other relatively minor work is proposed on the rear porch and deck. The building is included in the Vermont state historic register.

The focus of this Design Advisory Board review is the proposed replacement windows. The existing wooden windows are to be replaced with windows consisting of clad wood and vinyl structure. The sashes are clad wooden units, and the head is also clad wood. The sill is constructed of vinyl but clad on the exterior like the rest of the window components. There is precedent dating to 2007 to allow replacement of wooden windows in historic buildings with clad wooden replacement units with simulated divided lights to match the original window appearance. DAB review is requested on this application because the proposed replacement windows are not fully wooden units.

Article 5: Citywide General Regulations
Part 4: Special Use Regulations
Sec. 5.4.8 Historic Buildings and Sites
The City seeks to preserve, maintain, and enhance those aspects of the city having historical, architectural, archaeological, and cultural merit. Specifically, these regulations seek to achieve the following goals:

- To preserve, maintain and enhance Burlington’s historic character, scale, architectural integrity, and cultural resources;
To foster the preservation of Burlington’s historic and cultural resources as part of an attractive, vibrant, and livable community in which to live, work and visit;

- To promote a sense of community based on understanding the city’s historic growth and development, and maintaining the city’s sense of place by protecting its historic and cultural resources; and,

- To promote the adaptive re-use of historic buildings and sites.

(a) Applicability:

These regulations shall apply to all buildings and sites in the city that are listed, or eligible for listing, on the State or National Register of Historic Places.

The residence at 352 South Winooski Ave dates to 1927 and is included in the Vermont historic register.

(b) Standards and Guidelines:

The following development standards, following the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties, shall be used in the review of all applications involving historic buildings and sites subject to the provisions of this section and the requirements for Design Review in Art 3, Part 4. The Secretary of the Interior’s Standards are basic principles created to help preserve the distinctive character of a historic building and its site. They are a series of concepts about maintaining, repairing and replacing historic features, as well as designing new additions or making alterations. These Standards are intended to be applied in a reasonable manner, taking into consideration economic and technical feasibility.

6. Deteriorated historic features will be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature will match the old in design, color, texture, and, where possible, materials recognizing that new technologies may provide an appropriate alternative in order to adapt to ever changing conditions and provide for an efficient contemporary use. Replacement of missing features will be substantiated by documentary and physical evidence.

The longstanding requirement for replacement of wooden windows in historic buildings has been wooden or clad wooden units. Simulated divided lights matching the appearance of the original windows are acceptable. This standard originated in a 2007 decision stemming from litigation at Superior Court Environmental Division for replacement windows in an historic residence on Blodgett Street and has been applied ever since.

The proposed replacement windows in this application are very close to meeting the standard for historic buildings; however, as they are not fully wooden underneath the cladding, they do not quite meet the standard. The applicant has pointed to similar replacement windows at 133 North Winooski Avenue. Those window cut sheets are provided for reference. They depict the same brand of window with wooden core throughout and differ from the cut sheets provided for this application.

RECOMMENDED MOTION:
The proposed replacement windows are not fully consistent with current standards for historic buildings. Proposed replacement windows should be revised for consistency with current standards.