MEMORANDUM

To: Design Advisory Board
From: Scott Gustin
Re: 86-88 North Winooski Avenue
Date: March 15, 2022

File: ZP-22-54
Location: 86-88 North Winooski Avenue
Zone: RM Ward: 2C
Parking District: Neighborhood
Date application accepted: January 25, 2022, Complete March 7, 2022
Applicant/Owner: Michael Alvanos / 3G, LLC
Request: Replace the windows and siding on the residence. Repair rear porch in-kind.

Overview:
The applicant is seeking approval to replace all of the exterior wooden siding and trim on the historic duplex. Replacement windows are proposed throughout, and the rear porch will be repaired in-kind (no alterations). The building is included on the Vermont state historic register.

The focus of this Design Advisory Board review is the proposed exterior siding and trim. The replacement windows are acceptable clad wooden units, and no porch alterations are proposed. There is long-standing precedent to allow replacement of wooden clapboard siding with fiber cement clapboards on historic buildings. There is also precedent to allow replacement of wooden trim elements with composite material on historic buildings. DAB review is requested on this application because the proposed siding and trim product is fly ash based (TruExterior). Installation of this material on historic buildings in Burlington has not yet been permitted or sought.

Article 5: Citywide General Regulations
Part 4: Special Use Regulations
Sec. 5.4.8 Historic Buildings and Sites
The City seeks to preserve, maintain, and enhance those aspects of the city having historical, architectural, archaeological, and cultural merit. Specifically, these regulations seek to achieve the following goals:

- To preserve, maintain and enhance Burlington’s historic character, scale, architectural integrity, and cultural resources;
To foster the preservation of Burlington’s historic and cultural resources as part of an attractive, vibrant, and livable community in which to live, work and visit;

- To promote a sense of community based on understanding the city’s historic growth and development, and maintaining the city’s sense of place by protecting its historic and cultural resources; and,
- To promote the adaptive re-use of historic buildings and sites.

(a) Applicability:

These regulations shall apply to all buildings and sites in the city that are listed, or eligible for listing, on the State or National Register of Historic Places.

The residence at 86-88 North Winooski Ave dates to 1885 and is included in the Vermont historic register.

(b) Standards and Guidelines:

The following development standards, following the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties, shall be used in the review of all applications involving historic buildings and sites subject to the provisions of this section and the requirements for Design Review in Art 3, Part 4. The Secretary of the Interior’s Standards are basic principles created to help preserve the distinctive character of a historic building and its site. They are a series of concepts about maintaining, repairing and replacing historic features, as well as designing new additions or making alterations. These Standards are intended to be applied in a reasonable manner, taking into consideration economic and technical feasibility.

6. Deteriorated historic features will be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature will match the old in design, color, texture, and, where possible, materials recognizing that new technologies may provide an appropriate alternative in order to adapt to ever changing conditions and provide for an efficient contemporary use. Replacement of missing features will be substantiated by documentary and physical evidence.

As noted above, both fiber cement clapboard and composite trim have been approved for use as replacement material on historic buildings in Burlington. Fiber cement was originally approved through decision of the Vermont Superior Court Environmental Division in 2009. Composite trim was approved by decision of the Design Advisory Board in 2011 for installation on the Kilburn & Gates building. Numerous installations of both materials have occurred since. In all cases, use of these materials is predicated on matching or similar reveal and dimensions.

The proposed fly ash clapboard siding appears to be very close to fiber cement clapboards in appearance and performance, albeit with different ingredients. Like fiber cement clapboards, it is installed as individual boards (rather than in sheets like vinyl siding) and has a finished appearance very similar to wooden clapboards. The same can be said of the proposed fly ash trim material. It appears to be very similar in appearance and durability to composite siding with a finished look similar to wood.

RECOMMENDED MOTION:
Recommend approval to use the proposed fly ash based siding and trim material for installation on the historic building at 86-88 North Winooski Avenue.