

Department of Planning and Zoning

149 Church Street, City Hall
Burlington, VT 05401
www.burlingtonvt.gov/pz
Phone: (802) 865-7188
Fax: (802) 865-7195

David White, AICP, Director
Meagan Tuttle, Comprehensive Planner
Jay Appleton, Senior GIS/IT Programmer/Analyst
Scott Gustin, AICP, CFM, Principal Planner
Mary O'Neil, AICP, Principal Planner
Ryan Morrison, CFM, Associate Planner
Anita Wade, Zoning Clerk



MEMORANDUM

To: The Design Advisory Board
From: Mary O'Neil, AICP, Principal Planner
RE: ZP17-0479CA
Date: November 9, 2016

File: ZP17-0479CA

Location: 79 Lakeside Avenue

Zone: RL-W **Ward:** 5S

Date application accepted: October 12, 2016

Revised plans received (version 3): October 27, 2016

Applicant/ Owner: Rebecca Schwarz

Request: Expand 2nd floor of existing single family home.

Background:

- Zoning Permit 09-550CA; replace 2 windows and 2 exterior doors; install 3 new windows, replace front awning with canopy; reconstruct rear entrance/roofline. Approved February 2009.
- Zoning Permit 87-832 / COA 88-064; addition of two 6' x 8' dormers on north side, and addition of two 3' x 4' windows on the east and west sides of the home. Approved April, 1980; permit relinquished (work not done.)
- ZP81-529; erect 4' picket fence to enclose front and one side of yard. Approved June 1981.
- Zoning Board of Adjustment Review, seeking to expand a non-conforming use (d.b.a. "The Muffin Bar") by erecting an 18' x 27' addition to existing building and to vary the off street parking requirements. Denied, June 1969.



Overview: 79 Lakeside Avenue is a single family home, located on the corner of Lakeside Avenue and Conger Avenue and within the **Lakeside Historic District** on the National Register of Historic Places (Listed April 1982.) The building's original use was a barber shop to serve the mill neighborhood, and is dated at approximately 1899.

The owner proposes an expansion of the second floor.

As the proposal will increase floor area less than 50% of the existing gross floor area and they are more than 200 feet from the lake, the project may be reviewed administratively per **Section 3.2.7 (a) 9**. Staff will follow the direction of the Design Advisory Board.

Part 1: Land Division Design Standards

Not applicable.



Part 2: Site Plan Design Standards

Sec. 6.2.2 Review Standards

(a) Protection of Important Natural Features:

There are no important natural features associated with the site.

(b) Topographical Alterations:

No topographical alterations are proposed.

(c) Protection of Important Public Views:

There are no important public views to be protected from this parcel.

(d) Protection of Important Cultural Resources:

Burlington’s architectural and cultural heritage shall be protected through sensitive and respectful redevelopment, rehabilitation, and infill. Archeological sites likely to yield information important to the city’s or the region’s pre-history or history shall be evaluated, documented, and avoided whenever feasible. Where the proposed development involves sites listed or eligible for listing on a state or national register of historic places, the applicant shall meet the applicable development and design standards pursuant to Sec. 5.4.8(b).

See Section 5.4.8, below.

(e) Supporting the Use of Renewable Energy Resources:

There is nothing within the application to preclude the use of wind, solar, water, geothermal or other renewable energy resources.

(f) Brownfield Sites:

There are no identified hazardous sites or brownfields at this address.

(g) Provide for nature's events:

Special attention shall be accorded to stormwater runoff so that neighboring properties and/or the public stormwater drainage system are not adversely affected. All development and site disturbance shall follow applicable city and state erosion and stormwater management guidelines in accordance with the requirements of Art 5, Sec 5.5.3.

Design features which address the effects of rain, snow, and ice at building entrances, and to provisions for snow and ice removal or storage from circulation areas shall also be incorporated.

The existing canopy at the front door entrance (Conger Avenue façade) will be retained. The rear (easterly) entrance has no roof cover, which would be recommended for resident comfort if not for the potential to increase already non-conforming lot coverage.

There is an existing parking/drive area, parallel to the applicant-owned ROW. As the right-of-way is plowed, there is room both within the backyard (east) area or this parcel and along the ROW for snow storage.

(h) Building Location and Orientation:

The home will continue to front both Lakeside Avenue and Conger Avenue, although the latter is the functional frontage. There will be no change to the building's orientation.

(i) Vehicular Access:

Access will remain as existing; vehicles will enter the ROW from Conger Avenue, and park within the existing parking alley.

(j) Pedestrian Access:

Pedestrian access will continue as it exists today; residents may enter on the east elevation via the deck/entry, or the west elevation by principal entrance door. There is a sidewalk along the east side of Conger Avenue which is accessible to the ROW, drive area and house.

(k) Accessibility for the Handicapped:

There is no requirement for h/c accessibility for a single family home.

(l) Parking and Circulation:

Parking and circulation are unaffected by the proposal. Two parking spaces remain.

(m) Landscaping and Fences:

This is an existing, developed lot with landscaping on the parcel as well as within the adjacent public ROW on Lakeside. A picket fence was permitted in 1981. Photos show a stockade fence on the north side of the property; there is no permit for this feature, and it appears to be within the public right-of-way. A portion of the easterly deck will be removed to reduce coverage. No other landscaping or fence changes have been identified within the plan.

(n) Public Plazas and Open Space:

There are no public plazas within the project area. Not applicable.

(o) Outdoor Lighting:

Where exterior lighting is proposed the applicant shall meet the lighting performance standards as per Sec 5.5.2.

No lighting information has been submitted and is required.

(p) Integrate infrastructure into the design:

Exterior storage areas, machinery and equipment installations, service and loading areas, utility meters and structures, mailboxes, and similar accessory structures shall utilize setbacks, plantings, enclosures and other mitigation or screening methods to minimize their auditory and visual impact on the public street and neighboring properties to the extent practicable.

Utility and service enclosures and screening shall be coordinated with the design of the principal building, and should be grouped in a service court away from public view. On-site utilities shall be placed underground whenever practicable. Trash and recycling bins and dumpsters shall be located, within preferably, or behind buildings, enclosed on all four (4) sides to prevent blowing trash, and screened from public view.

Any development involving the installation of machinery or equipment which emits heat, vapor, fumes, vibration, or noise shall minimize, insofar as practicable, any adverse impact on neighboring properties and the environment pursuant to the requirements of Article 5, Part 4 Performance Standards.

Submitted photos show a roll-off garbage can on the east, adjacent to a stockade fence. This may not be associated with this parcel, but a neighbors. The applicant shall define.

The location of trash and recycling storage areas needs to be defined.

The mailbox is presumed to remain in its current location on Conger Ave. The applicant shall confirm.

Part 3: Architectural Design Standards

Sec. 6.3.2 Review Standards

(a) Relate development to its environment:

1. Massing, Height and Scale:

Buildings east, west and south of this parcel are 2-2 ½ stories tall; typically, residential buildings constructed in support of the former Queen City Cotton Mill. The small size of this building can clearly be linked to its original use as a commercial space (barber shop) serving mill workers and neighborhood residents. The request to add a storey will be consistent with neighboring residential structures, but divergent from the building’s original scale.

2. Roofs and Rooflines.

The building has a gable roof; a gable roof is proposed.

3. Building Openings

Entry doors will remain in the same location. As anticipated, new window openings are proposed for the 2nd floor.

There is inconsistent arrangement with windows; the second floor south places transom style windows above or within a closet; their size and location under an eave line will not likely provide much light. A similar window is proposed on the north, 2nd floor.

While a more rhythmic arrangement would be preferred, the internal use is dictating window size and location.

(b) Protection of Important Architectural Resources:

Burlington's architectural and cultural heritage shall be protected through sensitive and respectful redevelopment, rehabilitation, and infill. Where the proposed development involves buildings listed or eligible for listing on a state or national register of historic places, the applicant shall meet the applicable development and design standards pursuant to Sec. 5.4.8. The introduction of new buildings to a historic district listed on a state or national register of historic places shall make every effort to be compatible with nearby historic buildings.

See Section 5.4.8.

(c) Protection of Important Public Views:

Not applicable.

(d) Provide an active and inviting street edge:

The new design will give a stylistic addition of a projecting window bay on the second floor. Water table elements are proposed to segregate the differing levels, with ornamental brackets proposed under the (westerly) roofline.

(e) Quality of materials:

All development shall maximize the use of highly durable building materials that extend the life cycle of the building, and reduce maintenance, waste, and environmental impacts. Such materials are particularly important in certain highly trafficked locations such as along major streets, sidewalks, loading areas, and driveways. Efforts to incorporate the use of recycled content materials and building materials and products that are extracted and/or manufactured within the region are highly encouraged.

Owners of historic structures are encouraged to consult with an architectural historian in order to determine the most appropriate repair, restoration or replacement of historic building materials as outlined by the requirements of Art 5, Sec. 5.4.8.

Painted Hardi-shingle siding is proposed, with Boral trim. Asphalt shingles are intended for the new roof.

The building currently has vinyl siding and replacement windows.

(f) Reduce energy utilization:

New structures are required to meet the Guidelines for Energy Efficient Construction pursuant to Article VI. Energy Conservation, Section 8 of the City of Burlington Code of Ordinances.

(g) Make advertising features complementary to the site:

Not applicable.

(h) Integrate infrastructure into the building design:

See Section 6.2.2. (p), above.

(i) Make spaces secure and safe:

The project will be required to adhere to all applicable building and life safety requirements as defined by the building inspector and fire marshal.

Sec. 5.4.8 Historic Buildings and Sites

The City seeks to preserve, maintain, and enhance those aspects of the city having historical, architectural, archaeological, and cultural merit. Specifically, these regulations seek to achieve the following goals:

To preserve, maintain and enhance Burlington's historic character, scale, architectural integrity, and cultural resources;

To foster the preservation of Burlington's historic and cultural resources as part of an attractive, vibrant, and livable community in which to live, work and visit;

To promote a sense of community based on understanding the city's historic growth and development, and maintaining the city's sense of place by protecting its historic and cultural resources; and,

To promote the adaptive re-use of historic buildings and sites.

(a) Applicability:

These regulations shall apply to all buildings and sites in the city that are listed, or eligible for listing, on the State or National Register of Historic Places.

79 Lakeside Avenue is listed on the National Register of Historic Places within the Lakeside Historic District. From that nomination:

79 Lakeside Avenue Circa 1899. One and on-half story, wood frame dwelling with a fieldstone foundation, clapboard siding, and an asphalt-shingled hip roof. The building is roughly square, measuring three by two bays across the front and side elevations respectively. Original use: barber shop.

(b) Standards and Guidelines:

- 1. A property will be used as it was historically or be given a new use that requires minimal change to its distinctive materials, features, spaces, and spatial relationships.*

The historic use as a barber shop terminated sometime after 1937 when the Queen City Cotton Mill quit claimed this property to William and Catherin Ready. Land records confirm it's use as a dwelling in following deeds.

The original materials and features have been lost, with the installation of vinyl siding and replacement window sash. The building's size, orientation and entry locations may support identification of a different original use, but little of characteristic features remain that might suggest its original service use as part of the company-founded neighborhood.

2. *The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features, spaces, and spatial relationships that characterize a property will be avoided.*

The application proposes a significant change to the spatial relationship/mass of the building; turning a one story structure into one with two. As noted, material replacement has already occurred.

3. *Each property will be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or elements from other historic properties, will not be undertaken.*

The addition of a 2nd story would be consistent with neighboring residential structures; the proposed bay window and brackets attractive yet unrelated to the original barber shop structure.

4. *Changes to a property that have acquired historic significance in their own right will be retained and preserved.*

There are no identified changes that merit retention and preservation.

5. *Distinctive materials, features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property will be preserved.*

There are no extant materials, finishes, or construction techniques or example of craftsmanship that merit preservation. The *scale* of the building is the primary original characteristic, which has diminished appreciative value in concert with all other changes.

6. *Deteriorated historic features will be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature will match the old in design, color, texture, and, where possible, materials recognizing that new technologies may provide an appropriate alternative in order to adapt to ever changing conditions and provide for an efficient contemporary use. Replacement of missing features will be substantiated by documentary and physical evidence.*

The application is not intended to replace deteriorated features, but to increase the scale and function of the building. No missing features have been identified or planned for replacement.

7. *Chemical or physical treatments, if appropriate, will be undertaken using the gentlest means possible. Treatments that cause damage to historic materials will not be used.*

Not applicable.

8. *Archeological resources will be protected and preserved in place. If such resources must be disturbed, mitigation measures will be undertaken.*

No archaeological resources have been identified with this site. It is not likely to uncover any new resources as no ground disturbance is proposed.

9. *New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale, and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.*

The proposed exterior alteration is notable for the resultant change in massing and scale. There are no materials, features, or craftsmanship remaining.

10. *New additions and adjacent or related new construction will be undertaken in such a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.*

It is unlikely that the proposed 2nd story addition could be removed with the single story structure intact. The project may be considered irreversible.



79 Lakeside Avenue
1984 Assessor's photo

Items for the Board's consideration:

1. The principal consideration of the DAB is whether the structure retains enough historic integrity to merit retention of scale. If the existing single story structure is deemed to retain enough historic integrity, then the proposed alterations shall be deemed incompatible and in conflict with the standards of Section 5.4.8.
2. If recommended for approval, lighting information will be required.
3. The stockade fence and any other ancillary features must be removed from the public right-of-way along Lakeside Avenue.
4. Submitted photos show a roll-off garbage can on the east, adjacent to a stockade fence. The location of trash and recycling storage areas for this parcel need to be defined.
5. The mailbox is presumed to remain in its current location on Conger Ave. The applicant shall confirm.