MEMORANDUM

To: The Design Advisory Board
From: Mary O’Neil, AICP, Principal Planner
RE: ZP21-509 72-76 Elmwood Avenue
Date: September 28, 2021

File: 21-509
Location: 72-76 Elmwood Avenue
Zone: RM  Ward: 2C
Parking District: Neighborhood
Date application accepted: June 24, 2021
Request to defer for redesign and survey: July 23, 2021
Revised plans received: October 26, 2021
Applicant/ Owner: Michael Alvanos / PBGC LLC (Bill Bissonette)
Request: Build three unit detached residential structure on the site of the former Free Methodist Church. One existing single family residence remains on site. (Planned Unit Development)

Background:

The programs and services of the City of Burlington are accessible to people with disabilities. For accessibility information call 865-7188 (for TTY users 865-7142).
• **Zoning Permit 20-0702CA;** Demolition of remaining foundation from fire totaled building. February 21, 2020; permit relinquished without action.

• **Non-Applicability of Zoning Permit Requirements;** rebuilding wheelchair ramp on east side of church (rear entrance); temporary ramp. August 2014.

• **Zoning Permit 85-263;** erect a picket fence, 4’ high along the west and south boundaries. Construct storage shed on the east end of the property. June 1985.

• **Zoning Permit 81-596;** demolish a storage shed and rebuild 8’ x12’ which will replace existing storage shed. July 1981.

• **Zoning Permit 78-730;** Erect a steel storage shed in the rear of the church. May 1978.

• **Zoning Permit 76-419;** Replace front stairs and the sill in the rear of the building, erect a new floor for the porch. October 1975.

• **Zoning Permit n.n.;** erect a 6’ x 45’ chain link fence on the east and west property lines of 76 Elmwood Avenue and 16 Grant Street. July 1974.

**Overview:**
Burlington’s Free Methodist Church was largely lost to a fire January 15, 2015. The rectory, a single family home on the same site, survived. The parcel has changed hands a number of times, and is now proposed for redevelopment; retaining the existing home, and added a detached three unit residential building.

**Part 1: Land Division Design Standards**
Not applicable.

**Part 2: Site Plan Design Standards**
**Sec. 6.2.2 Review Standards**

(a)**Protection of Important Natural Features:**
This site remains unchanged since the 2015 fire. The foundation, which was permitted to be removed has remained and that permit relinquished without exercise.

(b) **Topographical Alterations:**
No topographical alterations are noted in the plans. Any retaining wall over 3’ in height will require review by the City Engineer.

(c)**Protection of Important Public Views:**
There are no identified important public views from or through this site.

(d) **Protection of Important Cultural Resources:**
*Burlington’s architectural and cultural heritage shall be protected through sensitive and respectful redevelopment, rehabilitation, and infill. Archeological sites likely to yield*
information important to the city’s or the region's pre-history or history shall be evaluated, documented, and avoided whenever feasible. Where the proposed development involves sites listed or eligible for listing on a state or national register of historic places, the applicant shall meet the applicable development and design standards pursuant to Sec. 5.4.8(b).

The 1917 Free Methodist Church was listed on the Vermont State Register of Historic Resources; however since it has been lost, the historic designation no longer applies. The rear structure was not identified in that listing.

(e) **Supporting the Use of Renewable Energy Resources:**

No part of this application precludes the use of wind, water, solar, geothermal or other renewable energy resource.

(f) **Brownfield Sites:**

This is not an identified Brownfield site on Vermont’s Department of Environmental Conservation website.

(g) **Provide for nature's events:**

Special attention shall be accorded to stormwater runoff so that neighboring properties and/or the public stormwater drainage system are not adversely affected. All development and site disturbance shall follow applicable city and state erosion and stormwater management guidelines in accordance with the requirements of Art 5, Sec 5.5.3.

Design features which address the effects of rain, snow, and ice at building entrances, and to provisions for snow and ice removal or storage from circulation areas shall also be incorporated.

Front entries are placed within a modest overhang, assuring a modicum of shelter for residents. An Erosion Prevention and Sediment Control Plan will be required for the site disturbance.

There is room for snow storage either between the buildings, or at the easterly end of the site.

(h) **Building Location and Orientation:**

The new building will shoulder-up to Elmwood Avenue; filling the emptiness left by the loss of the Church. In placement it fills the hole in the streetscape and maintains the development pattern and rhythm of structures along the street. A principal entrance fronting onto Elmwood Avenue has been introduced consistent with these regulations:

*Principal buildings shall have their main entrance facing and clearly identifiable from the public street.*

(i) **Vehicular Access:**

Vehicular access will continue as pre-existing, from Elmwood Avenue. The site plan calls for an expanded curb cut. Any change to the existing access will require a curb cut permit from the Department of Public Works.
(j) Pedestrian Access:
There is a public sidewalk immediately in front of this parcel. The site plan illustrates a walkway to the entrance areas, under the roof overhang.

(k) Accessibility for the Handicapped:
There is no elevator included in the plan. A single handicap parking space with an access aisle is illustrated. This space is located furthest from entrances to the new building; however if intended for the existing single family home is appropriately sited. Conformance to ADA standards is under the jurisdiction of the building inspector.

(l) Parking and Circulation:
The site plan illustrates 8 on site parking spaces, meeting the minimum parking requirement for the Neighborhood Parking District. There is sufficient room for cars to back out and re-enter Elmwood Avenue from the parking area.
In the Neighborhood Parking District, 1 long-term bicycle parking space is required for every two bedrooms. For this three unit building with 12 bedrooms, 6 long term bike parking spaces will be needed.

(m) Landscaping and Fences:
Existing trees and fencing are shown on the site plan. No landscaping plan has been provided. Some plantings are encouraged to “settle” the new building into the site, and to screen the parking area from the street.
A small feature wall is proposed at the building entrance, with the street address visible.
**Section 7.1.3** of the Comprehensive Development Ordinance exempts street identification from the sign regulations, providing the numerals are a minimum of 3” and maximum of 10” in height, and the area of the numerals does not exceed two square feet. The applicant shall confirm. Walls in excess of 3’ in height require review by the City engineer. (Section 6.2.2. (b)).

(n) Public Plazas and Open Space:
A Planned Unit Development requires that there be identified some open space for tenants to enjoy. **(11.1.5 Approval Requirements), (g) Open space or common land shall be assured and maintained in accordance with the conditions as prescribed by the DRB.**
The site plan defines several areas of green space which may be programmed for seating, light recreation, or gardening by the residents.

(o) Outdoor Lighting:
*Where exterior lighting is proposed the applicant shall meet the lighting performance standards as per Sec 5.5.2.*
No information on lighting has been provided. From building modeling, recessed can lighting is evident under the entrance overhang. Specification sheets and illumination levels will be needed to assess any lighting.
Integrate infrastructure into the design:

Exterior storage areas, machinery and equipment installations, service and loading areas, utility meters and structures, mailboxes, and similar accessory structures shall utilize setbacks, plantings, enclosures and other mitigation or screening methods to minimize their auditory and visual impact on the public street and neighboring properties to the extent practicable.

The site plan does not reveal any mechanical equipment. If condensing units, mini-splits, or other external mechanical equipment is intended, they must be illustrated on the site plan/building elevations as appropriate, and screened where required.

Utility and service enclosures and screening shall be coordinated with the design of the principal building, and should be grouped in a service court away from public view. On-site utilities shall be place underground whenever practicable. Trash and recycling bins and dumpsters shall be located, within preferably, or behind buildings, enclosed on all four (4) sides to prevent blowing trash, and screened from public view.

The applicant needs to disclose the location of trash/recycling facilities. If a dumpster is proposed, it must be identified on the site plan, meeting required setbacks and be enclosed on all four sides to prevent blowing trash.

Any development involving the installation of machinery or equipment which emits heat, vapor, fumes, vibration, or noise shall minimize, insofar as practicable, any adverse impact on neighboring properties and the environment pursuant to the requirements of Article 5, Part 4 Performance Standards.

If any mechanical equipment is proposed, the applicant must reveal the type and location so any adverse impacts may be assessed.

Part 3: Architectural Design Standards
Sec. 6.3.2 Review Standards

(a) Relate development to its environment:

1. Massing, Height and Scale:

   72-76 Elmwood Avenue has only one abutting neighbor; 68 Elmwood Avenue. It is a gable-and-eaves front 2 ½ story residential building. Across the street on the corner of Peru Street is a modified Dutch Colonial, and the much grander St. Joseph’s rectory.

   Although presenting eaves-front to the street, the height and massing of the proposed building is consistent with other structures in the immediate area.

2. Roofs and Rooflines.
The proposed building has a modified cat-slide roof with dual pitch and zero eave extrusion. In style it reads as a modern infill.

3. Building Openings
Fenestration is a mix of triple and double ganged windows and single casements. Sliding doors are noted on the north elevation first floor and third floors.

(b) Protection of Important Architectural Resources:
Not applicable.

(c) Protection of Important Public Views:
See Section 6.2.2 (c), above.

(d) Provide an active and inviting street edge:
As designed, the building lacks typical façade articulation such as bays, horizontal and vertical façade articulation, porches, patios, articulated bases, step-backs or other street level details. Windows are stacked, however, providing a measure of arrangement. The plan is modernistic with a simplified form and little detailing. The only interest provided is the angular and asymmetrical roof line.

(e) Quality of materials:
All development shall maximize the use of highly durable building materials that extend the life cycle of the building, and reduce maintenance, waste, and environmental impacts. Such materials are particularly important in certain highly trafficked locations such as along major streets, sidewalks, loading areas, and driveways. Efforts to incorporate the use of recycled content and materials that are extracted and/or manufactured within the region are highly encouraged. Plans include fiber cement siding, with metal frame surrounds on windows and an asphalt shingle roof. All are considered acceptable for new construction.

(f) Reduce energy utilization:
All new construction must meet the Guidelines for Energy Efficient Construction pursuant to the requirements of Article VI. Energy Conservation, Section 8 of the City of Burlington Code of Ordinances.

(g) Make advertising features complementary to the site:
Not applicable.

(h) Integrate infrastructure into the building design:
See Section 6.2.2. (p), above.
(i) Make spaces secure and safe:
Development shall observe all applicable building and life safety code as defined by the building inspector and/or fire marshal. Building entrances shall be visible and adequately lit, and intercom systems for multi-family housing should be incorporated where possible to maximize personal safety.

Section 5.4.8 Historic Buildings and Sites
Not applicable.

Items for the Board’s consideration:

- Any intended mechanical equipment (HVAC, Condensing Units, mini-splits, etc) shall be illustrated on the site plan/building elevations as appropriate. No mechanical equipment shall be allowed on the primary (westerly) elevation. Screening may be required elsewhere.
- Building elevations and the site plan must identify meters, utility connections, and mailboxes.
- A landscaping plan shall be provided, particularly with the addition of planting to screen the parking area from the public right-of-way.
- The location of trash and recycling facilities shall be identified. Any dumpster shall be fully enclosed to prevent blowing trash.
- Lighting information shall be provided.
- Bike parking shall be provided. In the Neighborhood Parking District, 1 long term bicycle parking space shall be provided for every 2 bedrooms. For the new three unit building, 6 long term bike parking spaces are required. These shall be shown on the plan, or identified as to location.