

Department of Planning and Zoning

149 Church Street, City Hall
Burlington, VT 05401
www.burlingtonvt.gov/pz
Phone: (802) 865-7188
Fax: (802) 865-7195

David White, AICP, Director
Meagan Tuttle, Comprehensive Planner
Jay Appleton, Senior GIS/IT Programmer/Analyst
Scott Gustin, AICP, CFM, Interim Chief Administrative Officer
Mary O'Neil, AICP, Senior Planner
Elsie Tillotson, Department Secretary
Anita Wade, Zoning Clerk



MEMORANDUM

To: The Design Advisory Board
From: Mary O'Neil, AICP, Senior Planner
RE: 100 Deforest Road; ZP16-0475CA
Date: November 10, 2015

File: ZP16-0475CA
Location: 100 Deforest Road
Zone: RL **Ward:** 6S
Date application accepted: October 13, 2015

Applicant/ Owner: Brown & Davis / David Weinstein & Erin Hanley
Request: Build foyer by enclosing entrance under existing porch roof; add skylight in stairwell; replacer all exterior windows and doors; build new master bath in existing garage with two skylights. Replace garage door, misc. exterior repairs.



On October 30, 2015 the applicant decided to split the request, and applied for window and door changes. That application was approved November 2, 2015. This review is solely on the request to construct an enclosure around the front door.

Background:

- ZO16-0551CA; Replace existing windows and doors, add skylight, exterior repairs. Approved November 2015.
- Zoning Permit 92-208; change existing door and window on north elevation of single family home to a pair of French doors. No change of use or mass. January 1992.

Overview: The original application covers a wide range of exterior and interior alterations at the single family residence, designed by Freeman French Freeman in 1939. The building was included within a Historic Sites and Structures Survey in 2005 which identified it as eligible for historic designation, in part to its association with the architectural firm.

The request to convert a portion of the garage to habitable area cannot be approved as it would render the parcel non-conforming to required parking: 2 parking spaces are required for the single family home. The driveway cannot be counted as a legal parking space as only 14'6" are outside the public right-of-way.

The window and garage door replacement meet the standards for review. **The sole issue before the Design Advisory Board is the appropriateness of enclosing the front entryway.**

Evaluation of development to historic structures typically requires minimization or avoidance of alteration on the primary façade to maintain the original character and features of the structure. Greater flexibility is offered on secondary facades; as has typified DAB and administrative decisions.

This is an administrative permit review; staff will exercise the decision of the Design Advisory Board in processing the permit.

Part 1: Land Division Design Standards

Not applicable.

Part 2: Site Plan Design Standards

Sec. 6.2.2 Review Standards

(a) Protection of Important Natural Features:

Not applicable.

(b) Topographical Alterations:

Not applicable.

(c) Protection of Important Public Views:

Not applicable.

(d) Protection of Important Cultural Resources:

Burlington's architectural and cultural heritage shall be protected through sensitive and respectful redevelopment, rehabilitation, and infill. Archeological sites likely to yield information important to the city's or the region's pre-history or history shall be evaluated, documented, and avoided whenever feasible. Where the proposed development involves sites listed or eligible for listing on a state or national register of historic places, the applicant shall meet the applicable development and design standards pursuant to Sec. 5.4.8(b).

See Section 5.4.8, below.

(e) Supporting the Use of Renewable Energy Resources:

Not applicable.

(f) Brownfield Sites:

Not applicable.

(g) Provide for nature's events:

Special attention shall be accorded to stormwater runoff so that neighboring properties and/or the public stormwater drainage system are not adversely affected. All development and site disturbance shall follow applicable city and state erosion and stormwater management guidelines in accordance with the requirements of Art 5, Sec 5.5.3.

Design features which address the effects of rain, snow, and ice at building entrances, and to provisions for snow and ice removal or storage from circulation areas shall also be incorporated.

The enclosed entryway will provide a dry refuge from inclement weather, and a transitional area between interior and exterior space.

(h) Building Location and Orientation:

No change. Not applicable.

(i) Vehicular Access:

Not applicable.

(j) Pedestrian Access:

Exterior pedestrian access will continue to follow the established walk. The enclosure will provide a shelter for resident comfort.

(k) Accessibility for the Handicapped:

Not required for a single family home, but encouraged.

(l) Parking and Circulation:

As noted, the existing parking arrangement satisfies the requirement of Article 8. To convert a portion of the interior garage space will render the site non-conforming to parking, and therefore cannot be approved. The driveway outside the garage is only 14'6" outside the public right-of-way, which is too small for a legal parking space.

(m) Landscaping and Fences:

Not applicable.

(n) Public Plazas and Open Space:

Not required, not applicable.

(o) Outdoor Lighting:

Where exterior lighting is proposed the applicant shall meet the lighting performance standards as per Sec 5.5.2.

No changes to lighting have been included within this submission. Any lighting will require compliance with the above noted standards.

(p) Integrate infrastructure into the design:

Exterior storage areas, machinery and equipment installations, service and loading areas, utility meters and structures, mailboxes, and similar accessory structures shall utilize setbacks, plantings, enclosures and other mitigation or screening methods to minimize their auditory and visual impact on the public street and neighboring properties to the extent practicable.

Utility and service enclosures and screening shall be coordinated with the design of the principal building, and should be grouped in a service court away from public view. On-site utilities shall be placed underground whenever practicable. Trash and recycling bins and dumpsters shall be

located, within preferably, or behind buildings, enclosed on all four (4) sides to prevent blowing trash, and screened from public view.

Any development involving the installation of machinery or equipment which emits heat, vapor, fumes, vibration, or noise shall minimize, insofar as practicable, any adverse impact on neighboring properties and the environment pursuant to the requirements of Article 5, Part 4 Performance Standards.

Not applicable.

Part 3: Architectural Design Standards

Sec. 6.3.2 Review Standards

(a) Relate development to its environment:

1. Massing, Height and Scale:

No change to the overall massing of the greater structure is proposed. The enclosure is limited to the principle entrance, which would be constructed on an existing entrance pad and not increase building footprint.

2. Roofs and Rooflines.

The enclosure is proposed within an existing slate shingle roof.

3. Building Openings

A new painted entry door is proposed as part of the front entry enclosure. A skylight has been approved for the east elevation.

(b) Protection of Important Architectural Resources:

Burlington's architectural and cultural heritage shall be protected through sensitive and respectful redevelopment, rehabilitation, and infill. Where the proposed development involves buildings listed or eligible for listing on a state or national register of historic places, the applicant shall meet the applicable development and design standards pursuant to Sec. 5.4.8. The introduction of new buildings to a historic district listed on a state or national register of historic places shall make every effort to be compatible with nearby historic buildings.

See Section 5.4.8.

(c) Protection of Important Public Views:

Not applicable.

(d) Provide an active and inviting street edge:

The structure sits below street level and is screened by mature plantings. At present, it is difficult to visually inspect the front entrance; however the enhanced entryway with enclosure will provide an attractive and inviting element.

(e) Quality of materials:

All development shall maximize the use of highly durable building materials that extend the life cycle of the building, and reduce maintenance, waste, and environmental impacts. Such materials are particularly important in certain highly trafficked locations such as along major streets, sidewalks, loading areas, and driveways. Efforts to incorporate the use of recycled content materials and building materials and products that are extracted and/or manufactured within the region are highly encouraged.

Owners of historic structures are encouraged to consult with an architectural historian in order to determine the most appropriate repair, restoration or replacement of historic building materials as outlined by the requirements of Art 5, Sec. 5.4.8.

Clad wood windows have been approved under separate cover; a copper downspout is included adjacent to the principle entrance. Materials are recognized to be durable and long lasting.

(f) Reduce energy utilization:

The new windows are anticipated to have greater energy efficiency than the existing windows. The proposed entry enclosure will offer a weather lock that will assist in heat loss during the colder months.

(g) Make advertising features complementary to the site:

Not applicable.

(h) Integrate infrastructure into the building design:

Not applicable.

(i) Make spaces secure and safe:

All development must meet required building and life safety code as defined by the building inspector and fire marshal, as appropriate.

Sec. 5.4.8 Historic Buildings and Sites

The City seeks to preserve, maintain, and enhance those aspects of the city having historical, architectural, archaeological, and cultural merit. Specifically, these regulations seek to achieve the following goals:

To preserve, maintain and enhance Burlington's historic character, scale, architectural integrity, and cultural resources;

To foster the preservation of Burlington's historic and cultural resources as part of an attractive, vibrant, and livable community in which to live, work and visit;

To promote a sense of community based on understanding the city's historic growth and development, and maintaining the city's sense of place by protecting its historic and cultural resources; and,

To promote the adaptive re-use of historic buildings and sites.

(a) Applicability:

These regulations shall apply to all buildings and sites in the city that are listed, or eligible for listing, on the State or National Register of Historic Places.

100 Deforest Road was designed by the renowned architectural firm of Freeman French Freeman in 1939 for Proctor Page. It was included in the 2005 Historic Sites and Structures Survey for Prospect Park North and Middle, and was determined to be eligible for historic designation at that time.

(b) Standards and Guidelines:

The following development standards, following the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties, shall be used in the review of all applications involving historic buildings and sites subject to the provisions of this section and the requirements for Design Review in Art 3, Part 4. The Secretary of the Interior's Standards are basic principles created to help preserve the distinctive character of a historic building and its site. They are a series of concepts about maintaining, repairing and replacing historic features, as well as designing new additions or making alterations. These Standards are intended to be applied in a reasonable manner, taking into consideration economic and technical feasibility.

- 1. A property will be used as it was historically or be given a new use that requires minimal change to its distinctive materials, features, spaces, and spatial relationships.*

The property was constructed as a single family residence; which continues today.

- 2. The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features, spaces, and spatial relationships that characterize a property will be avoided.*

Window and door replacement are typical alterations. The enclosure of a front entrance which was not originally enclosed or part of an original design is an alteration that requires scrutiny to assess any impact to the character of the property. The original FFF plans illustrate the slate shed roof, a cross-buck entry door with a 6 light window, and latticework enclosing one side of the entry. The present proposal is for an enclosed area, largely glazed, to surround the primary entrance. In its light treatment and transparent appearance, the minor structure does not significantly impact the appearance of the dwelling and is clearly discernable as a more modern add-on..

- 3. Each property will be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or elements from other historic properties, will not be undertaken.*

No conjectural features are proposed. The entry enclosure is clearly designed to be a new addition.

- 4. Changes to a property that have acquired historic significance in their own right will be retained and preserved.*

Not applicable.

- 5. Distinctive materials, features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property will be preserved.*

The replacement windows have been chosen to reflect the design of the original windows, where they still exist. The multi-light panes are clearly associated with the Colonial Revival hybrid style that the original architects favored, particularly in this neighborhood.

6. *Deteriorated historic features will be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature will match the old in design, color, texture, and, where possible, materials recognizing that new technologies may provide an appropriate alternative in order to adapt to ever changing conditions and provide for an efficient contemporary use. Replacement of missing features will be substantiated by documentary and physical evidence.*

Windows are proposed to be replaced to match original fenestration patterns. Greater flexibility has been afforded on secondary facades.

7. *Chemical or physical treatments, if appropriate, will be undertaken using the gentlest means possible. Treatments that cause damage to historic materials will not be used.*

None proposed.

8. *Archeological resources will be protected and preserved in place. If such resources must be disturbed, mitigation measures will be undertaken.*

None identified. Not applicable.

9. *New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale, and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.*

The new enclosure will be easily identifiable as a more modern addition, yet articulated with a very light hand in a manner sensitive to the original structure. In its transparency, it avoids obscuring the appearance of the original entry.

10. *New additions and adjacent or related new construction will be undertaken in such a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.*

The new entry enclosure will be entirely reversible, should matters warrant it.