

Department of Planning and Zoning

149 Church Street, City Hall
Burlington, VT 05401
www.burlingtonvt.gov/pz
Phone: (802) 865-7188
Fax: (802) 865-7195

David White, AICP, Director
Meagan Tuttle, Comprehensive Planner
Jay Appleton, Senior GIS/IT Programmer/Analyst
Scott Gustin, AICP, CFM, Principal Planner
Mary O'Neil, AICP, Principal Planner
Ryan Morrison, CFM, Associate Planner
Elsie Tillotson, Department Secretary
Anita Wade, Zoning Clerk



MEMORANDUM

To: The Design Advisory Board
From: Mary O'Neil, AICP, Principal Planner
RE: ZP17-0011CA, 114 Charlotte Street
Date: July 26, 2016

File: ZP17-0011CA
Location: 114 Charlotte Street
Zone: RL **Ward:** 5S
Date application accepted: July 5, 2016
Applicant/ Owner: Grant Builders LLC /
Carolyn Millham
Request: Add second storey.

Background:

- Zoning Permit 16-1245CA; relocate garage, replace garage door, remove enclosed porch and replace with enlarged living space, rearrange drive way space, add steps and walkway. June 7, 2016.
- Non-applicability of Zoning Permit Requirements, remove damaged overhang roof without replacing roof. Replace with siding. June 2012.
- Zoning Permit 10-0543CA; ten replacement windows; includes 3 casements for egress. December 2009.



Survey 0402-5: 114 Charlotte Street
Burlington, VT, View northeast.
Photograph by Devin Colmar, 9/5/2007
Digital image on file at VT Division for Historic Preservation

Overview: The application wishes to install a full second story to the existing 1951 Traditional Minimalist Cape. The property was among those surveyed in 2007 within the Five Sisters ("New Harlam") Historic Sites and Structures Survey, and found to be eligible for historic designation. Section 5.4.8 therefore applies.

Part 1: Land Division Design Standards

Not applicable.

Part 2: Site Plan Design Standards

Sec. 6.2.2 Review Standards

(a) Protection of Important Natural Features:

Not applicable.

(b) Topographical Alterations:

Not applicable.

(c) Protection of Important Public Views:

There are no protected views from this site. Not applicable.

(d) Protection of Important Cultural Resources:

Burlington's architectural and cultural heritage shall be protected through sensitive and respectful redevelopment, rehabilitation, and infill. Archeological sites likely to yield information important to the city's or the region's pre-history or history shall be evaluated, documented, and avoided whenever feasible. Where the proposed development involves sites listed or eligible for listing on a state or national register of historic places, the applicant shall meet the applicable development and design standards pursuant to Sec. 5.4.8(b).

See Section 5.4.8, below.

(e) Supporting the Use of Renewable Energy Resources:

Although encouraged, the use of renewable energy resources is not a requirement of redevelopment.

(f) Brownfield Sites:

Not applicable.

(g) Provide for nature's events:

Special attention shall be accorded to stormwater runoff so that neighboring properties and/or the public stormwater drainage system are not adversely affected. All development and site disturbance shall follow applicable city and state erosion and stormwater management guidelines in accordance with the requirements of Art 5, Sec 5.5.3.

Design features which address the effects of rain, snow, and ice at building entrances, and to provisions for snow and ice removal or storage from circulation areas shall also be incorporated.

The east (primary) elevation is illustrated with a minor roof canopy for the protection and shelter of resident entry. A door on the south rear addition also has an abbreviated cover.

(h) Building Location and Orientation:

There is no change proposed to the building's orientation

(i) Vehicular Access:

No change proposed.

(j) Pedestrian Access:

No change proposed.

(k) Accessibility for the Handicapped:

This is not a requirement for single family homes.

(l) Parking and Circulation:

No request for a change has been made under this permit. 16-1245CA was approval for relocation of the garage.

(m) Landscaping and Fences:

Not applicable.

(n) Public Plazas and Open Space:

Not applicable.

(o) Outdoor Lighting:

Where exterior lighting is proposed the applicant shall meet the lighting performance standards as per Sec 5.5.2.

If exterior lighting is proposed, spec sheets for the proposed fixtures should be forwarded to staff for review.

(p) Integrate infrastructure into the design:

Exterior storage areas, machinery and equipment installations, service and loading areas, utility meters and structures, mailboxes, and similar accessory structures shall utilize setbacks, plantings, enclosures and other mitigation or screening methods to minimize their auditory and visual impact on the public street and neighboring properties to the extent practicable.

Utility and service enclosures and screening shall be coordinated with the design of the principal building, and should be grouped in a service court away from public view. On-site utilities shall be placed underground whenever practicable. Trash and recycling bins and dumpsters shall be located, within preferably, or behind buildings, enclosed on all four (4) sides to prevent blowing trash, and screened from public view.

Any development involving the installation of machinery or equipment which emits heat, vapor, fumes, vibration, or noise shall minimize, insofar as practicable, any adverse impact on neighboring properties and the environment pursuant to the requirements of Article 5, Part 4 Performance Standards.

Any utility connections, meters, mailboxes, or mechanical equipment needs to be illustrated on building elevations or site plans, as appropriate. An assessment will be made for the need for screening.

Part 3: Architectural Design Standards
Sec. 6.3.2 Review Standards

(a) Relate development to its environment:

1. Massing, Height and Scale:

The Five Sisters neighborhood has a mixture of single story, 1 ½ and 2 storey residential structures. The greater building mass proposed in the application can find similarities within the context of the overall development area.

2. Roofs and Rooflines.

The building currently has a gable roof; elevated to higher eave line on the rear. The gable detail over the front door is a common feature in Minimalist Traditional buildings of the 1950s (see Section 5.4.8.) The two storey gable roof proposed can find common examples within the neighborhood.

3. Building Openings

Windows are proposed to be altered to 8/1 double hung; currently the house has 6/1 on the primary façade with a characteristic picture window. An awning window is proposed on the 2nd floor north and 2nd floor west elevation; each with a muntin pattern.

(b) Protection of Important Architectural Resources:

Burlington's architectural and cultural heritage shall be protected through sensitive and respectful redevelopment, rehabilitation, and infill. Where the proposed development involves buildings listed or eligible for listing on a state or national register of historic places, the applicant shall meet the applicable development and design standards pursuant to Sec. 5.4.8. The introduction of new buildings to a historic district listed on a state or national register of historic places shall make every effort to be compatible with nearby historic buildings.

See Section 5.4.8.

(c) Protection of Important Public Views:

Not applicable.

(d) Provide an active and inviting street edge:

The expanded residence is designed with alternating sheathing (original plans were shingle 2nd storey, fiber cement clapboard first storey; revised plans received July 18, 2016 have vertical siding on the second floor, clapboard or fiber cement on the first floor); a pleasing arrangement of building openings, and a front door that faces the public way. In arrangement and appearance, the house presents an inviting addition to the streetscape.

(e) Quality of materials:

All development shall maximize the use of highly durable building materials that extend the life cycle of the building, and reduce maintenance, waste, and environmental impacts. Such

materials are particularly important in certain highly trafficked locations such as along major streets, sidewalks, loading areas, and driveways. Efforts to incorporate the use of recycled content materials and building materials and products that are extracted and/or manufactured within the region are highly encouraged.

Owners of historic structures are encouraged to consult with an architectural historian in order to determine the most appropriate repair, restoration or replacement of historic building materials as outlined by the requirements of Art 5, Sec. 5.4.8.

Asphalt Shingle and fiber cement or wood clapboard siding are proposed. The vertical siding is not specified. All of the former are considered of acceptable durability.

The house currently has synthetic siding.

(f) Reduce energy utilization:

All new construction is required to meet the Guidelines for Energy Efficient Construction pursuant to the requirements of Article VI Energy Conservation, Section 8 of the City of Burlington Code of Ordinances.

(g) Make advertising features complementary to the site:

Not applicable.

(h) Integrate infrastructure into the building design:

See Section 6.2.2. (p), above.

(i) Make spaces secure and safe:

Development will be required to adhere to all building and life safety codes, as defined by the building inspector and fire marshal. This may include requirements specific to ingress and egress.

Sec. 5.4.8 Historic Buildings and Sites

The City seeks to preserve, maintain, and enhance those aspects of the city having historical, architectural, archaeological, and cultural merit. Specifically, these regulations seek to achieve the following goals:

To preserve, maintain and enhance Burlington's historic character, scale, architectural integrity, and cultural resources;

To foster the preservation of Burlington's historic and cultural resources as part of an attractive, vibrant, and livable community in which to live, work and visit;

To promote a sense of community based on understanding the city's historic growth and development, and maintaining the city's sense of place by protecting its historic and cultural resources; and,

To promote the adaptive re-use of historic buildings and sites.

(a) Applicability:

These regulations shall apply to all buildings and sites in the city that are listed, or eligible for listing, on the State or National Register of Historic Places.

114 Charlotte Street was included within the 2007 Historic Sites and Structures Survey of the Five Sisters Neighborhood (“New Harlam.”) The survey report identified the area as providing excellent examples of early to mid twentieth century residential architecture; “primarily Colonial Revival, Bungalow and Minimalist Traditional style houses.” 114 Charlotte Street is an example of the latter, and identified as eligible for historic designation.

The survey report also notes:

Not wanting to leave the neighborhood, several residents have opted to add on to their homes by building large additions or second stories. While such projects are relatively limited at the present time, there will undoubtedly be increased construction in the near future as residents expand their smaller, early twentieth century homes to meet the needs of their twenty-first century lifestyles. A careful evaluation of the existing resources and knowledge of the history of the area can help guide the next stage in the evolution of the Five Sisters Neighborhood.

Standards of **Section 5.4.8**

(b) Standards and Guidelines:

The following development standards, following the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties, shall be used in the review of all applications involving historic buildings and sites subject to the provisions of this section and the requirements for Design Review in Art 3, Part 4. The Secretary of the Interior’s Standards are basic principles created to help preserve the distinctive character of a historic building and its site. They are a series of concepts about maintaining, repairing and replacing historic features, as well as designing new additions or making alterations. These Standards are intended to be applied in a reasonable manner, taking into consideration economic and technical feasibility.

- 1. A property will be used as it was historically or be given a new use that requires minimal change to its distinctive materials, features, spaces, and spatial relationships.*

The property was constructed as a residential, single family home; a use that is proposed to continue.

- 2. The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features, spaces, and spatial relationships that characterize a property will be avoided.*

The appearance and the character of the house will be substantially altered by the development proposal. The application does not seek to “avoid” alteration of features, spaces or spatial relationships, but seeks them.

- 3. Each property will be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or elements from other historic properties, will not be undertaken.*

114 Charlotte Street is on lot #20 of the Charlotte Street extension plan filed by Paul D. Kelley in 1926. There is strong evidence that many of the homes within the neighborhood, Charlotte

an efficient contemporary use. Replacement of missing features will be substantiated by documentary and physical evidence.

Alterations are not proposed to ameliorate damage or failure, but to physically alter the appearance and floor plan of the dwelling.

7. *Chemical or physical treatments, if appropriate, will be undertaken using the gentlest means possible. Treatments that cause damage to historic materials will not be used.*

Not applicable.

8. *Archeological resources will be protected and preserved in place. If such resources must be disturbed, mitigation measures will be undertaken.*

There are no known archaeologically sensitive areas at this location. Not applicable.

9. *New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale, and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.*

The proposed “pop top” will significantly alter the features and spatial relationships of the 1951 residence, intentionally to capture the character of another house style and era. Changes will affect the size, scale, proportion and massing of the existing dwelling, contrary to this articulated standard.

10. *New additions and adjacent or related new construction will be undertaken in such a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.*

The new development will be so integrated into the existing structure that it cannot be considered reversible; also contrary to this standard.

Recommended motion: The CDO gives direction to treat eligible properties the same as historically listed properties; and the Standards of Section 5.4.8 (a) present specific guidance.

114 Charlotte Street has been identified within a consultant prepared report as part of a neighborhood notable for its examples of early to mid century residential architecture and the representation of catalog housing. Identified as Minimalist Traditional, 114 Charlotte Street is a demonstrative of post war residential architecture. Failure to align with the standards of Section 5.4.8 (b) 2, 3, 5, 6, 9, and 10 and by reference 6.2.2 (d) and 6.3.2 (b) advances a motion for **denial as proposed.**